

Memory Laws and Historical Justice

Elazar Barkan • Ariella Lang
Editors

Memory Laws and Historical Justice

The Politics of Criminalizing the Past

palgrave
macmillan

Editors

Elazar Barkan
School of International and
Public Affairs
Columbia University
New York, NY, USA

Ariella Lang
Institute for the Study of Human
Rights Columbia University
New York, NY, USA

ISBN 978-3-030-94913-6 ISBN 978-3-030-94914-3 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-94914-3>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2022

Chapter 5 is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>). For further details see licence information in the chapter.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

*For Carl and Willow
and
For Lela, Nina and Gabe*

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 1 Mapping Memory Laws | 1 |
| Elazar Barkan and Ariella Lang | |
| Part I European Bookends: Acknowledging Guilt and Confronting Denial | 23 |
| 2 French Laws for a Better Past | 25 |
| Henry Rousso | |
| 3 (De) Criminalizing the Past: Spain's Legal Response to History, Memory, and Historical Memory | 45 |
| Stephanie R. Golob | |
| Part II WMDs and Memory Laws: Revisiting the Holocaust versus Soviet Occupation | 73 |
| 4 Polish Memory Laws and the Distortion of the History of the Holocaust | 75 |
| Jan Grabowski | |
| 5 Legislating Historical Memory in Post-Soviet Ukraine | 97 |
| Tatiana Zhurzhenko | |

| | | |
|-----------------|--|------------|
| 6 | Holocaust Remembrance, the Cult of the War, and Memory Laws in Putin's Russia | 131 |
| | Nikolay Koposov | |
| 7 | Protecting Memory or Criminalizing Dissent: Memory Laws in Lithuania and Latvia | 167 |
| | Eva-Clarita Pettai | |
| 8 | Criminalizing Denial as a Form of Erasure: The Polish-Ukrainian-Israeli Triangle | 195 |
| | Omer Bartov | |
| Part III | Memory Laws as Majoritarian Assault | 223 |
| 9 | Memory Laws: The Continuation of Yugoslav Wars by Other Means | 225 |
| | Dubravka Stojanović | |
| 10 | Communism Versus National Socialism: Legislation as a Tool of Selective Historical Narrative in Hungary | 251 |
| | Eszter Kirs | |
| 11 | The Perils and Limits of Memory Laws: The Case of Israel's "Nakba Law" (2011) | 275 |
| | Yifat Gutman | |
| 12 | Memory Law and the Duty to Remember the "1994 Genocide Against the Tutsi" in Rwanda | 291 |
| | Erin Jessee and David Mwambari | |
| Index | | 321 |

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

Elazar Barkan is a Professor of International and Public Affairs and the Director of the Human Rights Concentration at Columbia's School of International and Public Affairs. His research interests focus on human rights and on the role of history in contemporary society and politics and the response to gross historical crimes and injustices. His books include *Historical Dialogue and the Prevention of Mass Atrocities*, an edited volume with Constantin Goschler and James E. Waller (2020); *Choreography of Sacred Spaces: State, Religion and Conflict Resolution*, (edited book with Karen Barkey, 2014); *No Return, No Refuge: Rites and Rights in Minority Repatriation* (with Howard Adelman, 2011); *The Guilt of Nations: Restitution and Negotiating Historical Injustices* (2000); *Claiming the Stones/Naming the Bones: Cultural Property and the Negotiation of National and Ethnic Identity*, (an edited volume with Ronald Bush, 2003); and *Taking Wrongs Seriously: Apologies and Reconciliation* (an edited volume with Alexander Karn, 2006).

Omer Bartov is the John P. Birkelund Distinguished Professor of European History at Brown University. Author of the prize-winning *Anatomy of a Genocide: The Life and Death of a Town Called Buczacz* (2018), which has been translated into multiple languages, Bartov has authored eight monographs and several edited volumes, most recently *Israel-Palestine: Lands and Peoples* (2021). His forthcoming book is titled *Tales from the Borderlands: Making and Unmaking the Past*.

Stephanie R. Golob is Department Chair and Associate Professor of Political Science at Baruch College, CUNY, where she also serves as the Director of the Initiative for the Study of Latin America (ISLA). She is also Faculty in the PhD/MA Program in Political Science at The Graduate Center, CUNY. Her essays on the Pinochet Case were awarded the Frank Cass Prize by the journal *Democratization*, and she is a member in an international research team based at the Spanish National Research Council (CCHS-CSIC) studying the politics of memory related to mass grave exhumations in Spain in comparative perspective. (<https://politicasdela memoria.org/>)

Jan Grabowski is Professor of History at the University of Ottawa. His research includes the issues surrounding the extermination of the Polish Jews as well as the history of the Jewish-Polish relations during the 1939–1945 period. He is the author of several monographs, including *Hunt for the Jews: Betrayal and Murder in German-Occupied Poland* (2013) which won the Yad Vashem International Book Prize for 2014. Grabowski has recently completed a project dealing with the involvement of the Polish “Blue” and criminal police in the Holocaust. His forthcoming research focuses on the open ghettos in the Generalgouvernement. In 2020, Grabowski was named a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada, and a Distinguished Fellow at the Institut für Zeitgeschichte in Munich, Germany. Other academic honors include the 2019 Arie van Mansum Award for Excellence in Holocaust Education and the 2014 Faculty of Arts Professor of the Year Award.

Yifat Gutman is a Senior Lecturer in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev. She holds a PhD in Sociology from the New School for Social Research in New York (2012). Her research focuses on memory activism and reconciliation in and after ethnonational conflict, as well as memory laws in comparative perspective. She is the author of *Memory Activism: Reimagining the Past for the Future in Israel-Palestine* (2017) and co-editor of the volume *Memory and the Future: Transnational politics, ethics and society* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2010).

Erin Jessee is Senior Lecturer in History at the University of Glasgow. Her research uses oral historical and ethnographic methods to engage with people’s diverse experiences of genocide and related mass atrocities, especially Rwanda, where she has spent over a decade working closely with

Rwandans from different sides of the conflict, and from varied socio-economic, regional, religious, and political backgrounds. She is the author of *Negotiating Genocide in Rwanda* (2017) and co-editor of *Researching Perpetrators of Genocide* (2020). She has written peer-reviewed articles with *Medical History*, *Memory Studies*, *Conflict and Society*, *Oral History Review*, and *History in Africa*, among others.

Eszter Kirs is Associate Professor at the Department of International Relations of the Corvinus University of Budapest since 2016. From 2003, she has been lecturing on international law and human rights at various academic institutions. She has been a legal officer of the Hungarian Helsinki Committee since 2013. From 2010 to 2015, she worked for a defense team at the ICTY. She was a Fulbright visiting researcher at the Columbia Law School in 2009–2010 and a visiting lecturer at the University of Minnesota Law School in 2019.

Nikolay Koposov (Emory University/Georgia Institute of Technology) is a scholar of modern European intellectual history, historiography, and historical memory. He has authored six books including *De l'imagination historique* (2009), *Pamyat' strogogo rezhima: Istoriya i politika v Rossii* (Strict-Security Memory: History and Politics in Russia) (2011), and *Memory Laws, Memory Wars: The Politics of the Past in Europe and Russia* (2017).

Ariella Lang is a Lecturer at the Institute for the Study of Human Rights at Columbia University, where she also serves as Associate Dean of Academic Affairs. Her research interests include Holocaust and genocide studies, historical memory, and transitional justice. Among other scholarly projects, Lang serves as editor for the Historical Dialogues Network; she was project author for the digital Mapping Historical Dialogue Project, and she served as guest editor for the 2019 volume, “Dealing with the Past: Mapping the Edges of ‘Historical Dialogue’,” published in *Kritika Kultura*.

David Mwambari is Lecturer in African Security and Leadership Studies at the African Leadership Centre at King's College London (UK). He is a Meaning-making Research Initiative (MRI) fellow at The Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa (CODESRIA). He is also a core faculty at the Oxford Consortium for Human Rights. His research seeks to contribute to leadership, peacebuilding and security studies; the politics of knowledge production in sensitive contexts; and memory studies.

Eva-Clarita Pettai is a senior research associate at the Imre Kertész Kolleg, University of Jena (Germany) and editor of the *Cultures of History Forum*. She has previously worked at the University of Tartu, Estonia, and written extensively about the politics and memory and transitional justice processes in the post-communist region, especially the Baltic states. In 2015, her book *Transitional and Retrospective Justice in the Baltic states* (co-authored with Vello Pettai) won the Baltic Assembly Prize for Literature, the Arts and Science.

Henry Rousso is senior researcher at the Centre national de la Recherche scientifique, member of the Institut d'histoire du temps présent, which he chaired from 1994 to 2005. He has been teaching in many French and foreign universities (Institut d'Études Politiques de Paris, École normale supérieure de Cachan, University of Paris I Sorbonne, and at Harvard University, University of Iena, Yale University, Columbia University, University of La Plata, Texas A&M University). His works focus on the history and memory of traumatic pasts, especially World War II. In February 2019, he was appointed by the French Government to conceive a Museum and Memorial on terrorism. His most recent books are *The Latest Catastrophe: History, the Present, the Contemporary* (2016); and *Face au passé: Essais sur la mémoire contemporaine* (Paris, 2016).

Dubravka Stojanović is Professor of History in the Faculty of Philosophy, University of Belgrade, where she teaches contemporary history. Her research interests include processes of modernization and Europeanization in South East Europe, the history of ideas, processes of democratization in Serbia, the history of urbanization, the history of Belgrade, the relation between history and memory, and presentations of history in history textbooks. She is a consultant at the United Nations, working on the issues of history and memory and misuses of history in education.

Tatiana Zhurzhenko teaches East European Politics at the Department of Political Science, University of Vienna. Her research interests include memory politics, borders and borderland identities as well as gender politics and feminism in Ukraine and the post-Soviet space. Her work was published in *Europe-Asia Studies*, *Nationalities Papers*, *East European Politics and Societies* (EEPS), and other academic journals. She is a co-editor (together with J. Fedor, M. Kangaspuro, and J. Lassila) of the collected volume *War and Memory in Russia, Ukraine and Belarus* (Palgrave 2017).