

# Marx, Engels, and Marxisms

## Series Editors

Marcello Musto, York University, Toronto, ON, Canada

Terrell Carver, University of Bristol, Bristol, UK

The Marx renaissance is underway on a global scale. Wherever the critique of capitalism re-emerges, there is an intellectual and political demand for new, critical engagements with Marxism. The peer-reviewed series *Marx, Engels and Marxisms* (edited by Marcello Musto & Terrell Carver, with Babak Amini, Francesca Antonini, Paula Rauhala & Kohei Saito as Assistant Editors) publishes monographs, edited volumes, critical editions, reprints of old texts, as well as translations of books already published in other languages. Our volumes come from a wide range of political perspectives, subject matters, academic disciplines and geographical areas, producing an eclectic and informative collection that appeals to a diverse and international audience. Our main areas of focus include: the oeuvre of Marx and Engels, Marxist authors and traditions of the 19th and 20th centuries, labour and social movements, Marxist analyses of contemporary issues, and reception of Marxism in the world.

Bertel Nygaard

# History and the Formation of Marxism

palgrave  
macmillan

Bertel Nygaard  
History and Classical Studies  
Aarhus University  
Aarhus, Denmark

ISSN 2524-7123

ISSN 2524-7131 (electronic)

Marx, Engels, and Marxisms

ISBN 978-3-031-09654-9

ISBN 978-3-031-09655-6 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-09655-6>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2022

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover image: © INTERFOTO/Alamy Stock Photo

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

## TITLES PUBLISHED

1. Terrell Carver & Daniel Blank, *A Political History of the Editions of Marx and Engels's "German Ideology" Manuscripts*, 2014.
2. Terrell Carver & Daniel Blank, *Marx and Engels's "German Ideology" Manuscripts: Presentation and Analysis of the "Feuerbach chapter,"* 2014.
3. Alfonso Maurizio Iacono, *The History and Theory of Fetishism*, 2015.
4. Paresh Chattopadhyay, *Marx's Associated Mode of Production: A Critique of Marxism*, 2016.
5. Domenico Losurdo, *Class Struggle: A Political and Philosophical History*, 2016.
6. Frederick Harry Pitts, *Critiquing Capitalism Today: New Ways to Read Marx*, 2017.
7. Ranabir Samaddar, *Karl Marx and the Postcolonial Age*, 2017.
8. George Comninel, *Alienation and Emancipation in the Work of Karl Marx*, 2018.
9. Jean-Numa Ducange & Razmig Keucheyan (Eds.), *The End of the Democratic State: Nicos Poulantzas, a Marxism for the 21st Century*, 2018.
10. Robert X. Ware, *Marx on Emancipation and Socialist Goals: Retrieving Marx for the Future*, 2018.
11. Xavier LaFrance & Charles Post (Eds.), *Case Studies in the Origins of Capitalism*, 2018.

12. John Gregson, *Marxism, Ethics, and Politics: The Work of Alasdair MacIntyre*, 2018.
13. Vladimir Puzone & Luis Felipe Miguel (Eds.), *The Brazilian Left in the 21st Century: Conflict and Conciliation in Peripheral Capitalism*, 2019.
14. James Muldoon & Gaard Kets (Eds.), *The German Revolution and Political Theory*, 2019.
15. Michael Brie, *Rediscovering Lenin: Dialectics of Revolution and Metaphysics of Domination*, 2019.
16. August H. Nimtz, *Marxism versus Liberalism: Comparative Real-Time Political Analysis*, 2019.
17. Gustavo Moura de Cavalcanti Mello and Mauricio de Souza Sabadini (Eds.), *Financial Speculation and Fictitious Profits: A Marxist Analysis*, 2019.
18. Shaibal Gupta, Marcello Musto & Babak Amini (Eds.), *Karl Marx's Life, Ideas, and Influences: A Critical Examination on the Bicentenary*, 2019.
19. Igor Shoikhedbrod, *Revisiting Marx's Critique of Liberalism: Rethinking Justice, Legality, and Rights*, 2019.
20. Juan Pablo Rodríguez, *Resisting Neoliberal Capitalism in Chile: The Possibility of Social Critique*, 2019.
21. Kaan Kangal, *Friedrich Engels and the Dialectics of Nature*, 2020.
22. Victor Wallis, *Socialist Practice: Histories and Theories*, 2020.
23. Alfonso Maurizio Iacono, *The Bourgeois and the Savage: A Marxian Critique of the Image of the Isolated Individual in Defoe, Turgot and Smith*, 2020.
24. Terrell Carver, *Engels before Marx*, 2020.
25. Jean-Numa Ducange, *Jules Guesde: The Birth of Socialism and Marxism in France*, 2020.
26. Antonio Oliva, Ivan Novara & Angel Oliva (Eds.), *Marx and Contemporary Critical Theory: The Philosophy of Real Abstraction*, 2020.
27. Francesco Biagi, *Henri Lefebvre's Critical Theory of Space*, 2020.
28. Stefano Petrucciani, *The Ideas of Karl Marx: A Critical Introduction*, 2020.
29. Terrell Carver, *The Life and Thought of Friedrich Engels, 30th Anniversary Edition*, 2020.
30. Giuseppe Vacca, *Alternative Modernities: Antonio Gramsci's Twentieth Century*, 2020.

31. Kevin B. Anderson, Kieran Durkin & Heather Brown (Eds.), *Raya Dunayevskaya's Intersectional Marxism: Race, Gender, and the Dialectics of Liberation*, 2020.
32. Marco Di Maggio, *The Rise and Fall of Communist Parties in France and Italy*, 2020.
33. Farhang Rajaee, *Presence and the Political*, 2021.
34. Ryuji Sasaki, *A New Introduction to Karl Marx: New Materialism, Critique of Political Economy, and the Concept of Metabolism*, 2021.
35. Kohei Saito (Ed.), *Reexamining Engels's Legacy in the 21st Century*, 2021.
36. Paresh Chattopadhyay, *Socialism in Marx's Capital: Towards a De-alienated World*, 2021.
37. Marcello Musto, *Karl Marx's Writings on Alienation*, 2021.
38. Michael Brie & Jörn Schüttrumpf, *Rosa Luxemburg: A Revolutionary Marxist at the Limits of Marxism*, 2021.
39. Stefano Petrucciani, *Theodor W. Adorno's Philosophy, Society, and Aesthetics*, 2021.
40. Miguel Vedda, *Siegfried Kracauer, or, The Allegories of Improvisation: Critical Studies*, 2021.
41. Ronaldo Munck, *Rethinking Development: Marxist Perspectives*, 2021.
42. Jean-Numa Ducange & Elisa Marcobelli (Eds.), *Selected Writings of Jean Jaurès: On Socialism, Pacifism and Marxism*, 2021.
43. Elisa Marcobelli, *Internationalism Toward Diplomatic Crisis: The Second International and French, German and Italian Socialists*, 2021.
44. James Steinhoff, *Automation and Autonomy: Labour, Capital and Machines in the Artificial Intelligence Industry*, 2021.
45. Juan Dal Maso, *Hegemony and Class Struggle: Trotsky, Gramsci and Marxism*, 2021.
46. Gianfranco Ragona & Monica Quirico, *Frontier Socialism: Self-organisation and Anti-capitalism*, 2021.
47. Tsuyoshi Yuki, *Socialism, Markets and the Critique of Money: The Theory of "Labour Notes"*, 2021.
48. Gustavo Moura de Cavalcanti Mello & Henrique Pereira Braga (Eds.), *Wealth and Poverty in Contemporary Brazilian Capitalism*, 2021.
49. Paolo Favilli, *Historiography and Marxism: Innovations in Mid-Century Italy*, 2021.

50. Levy del Aguila Marchena, *Communism, Political Power and Personal Freedom in Marx*, 2021.
51. V Geetha, *Bhimrao Ramji Ambedkar and the Question of Socialism in India*, 2021.
52. Satoshi Matsui, *Normative Theories of Liberalism and Socialism: Marxist Analysis of Values*, 2022.
53. Kei Ehara (Ed.), *Japanese Discourse on the Marxian Theory of Finance*, 2022.
54. Achim Szepanski, *Financial Capital in the 21st Century*, 2022.
55. Stephen Maher, *Corporate Capitalism and the Integral State: General Electric and a Century of American Power*, 2022.



## TITLES FORTHCOMING

- Vesa Oittinen, *Marx's Russian Moment*  
Kolja Lindner, *Marx, Marxism and the Question of Eurocentrism*  
Adriana Petra, *Intellectuals and Communist Culture: Itineraries, Problems and Debates in Post-war Argentina*  
George C. Comninel, *The Feudal Foundations of Modern Europe*  
Spencer A. Leonard, *Marx, the India Question, and the Crisis of Cosmopolitanism*  
Joe Collins, *Applying Marx's Capital to the 21st Century*  
Jeong Seongjin, *Korean Capitalism in the 21st Century: Marxist Analysis and Alternatives*  
Marcello Mustè, *Marxism and Philosophy of Praxis: An Italian Perspective from Labriola to Gramsci*  
Shannon Brincat, *Dialectical Dialogues in Contemporary World Politics: A Meeting of Traditions in Global Comparative Philosophy*  
Francesca Antonini, *Reassessing Marx's Eighteenth Brumaire: Dictatorship, State, and Revolution*  
Thomas Kemple, *Capital after Classical Sociology: The Faustian Lives of Social Theory*  
Xavier Vigna, *A Political History of Factories in France: The Workers' Insubordination of 1968*  
Attila Melegh, *Anti-Migrant Populism in Eastern Europe and Hungary: A Marxist Analysis*

- Marie-Cecile Bouju, *A Political History of the Publishing Houses of the French Communist Party*
- Peter McMyler, Graeme Kirkpatrick & Simin Fadaee (Eds.), *Marxism, Religion, and Emancipatory Politics*
- Mauro Buccheri, *Radical Humanism for the Left: The Quest for Meaning in Late Capitalism*
- Rémy Herrera, *Confronting Mainstream Economics to Overcome Capitalism*
- Tamás Krausz, Eszter Bartha (Eds.), *Socialist Experiences in Eastern Europe: A Hungarian Perspective*
- Martin Cortés, *Marxism, Time and Politics: On the Autonomy of the Political*
- João Antonio de Paula, Huga da Gama Cerqueira, Eduardo da Motta e Albuquerque & Leonardo de Deus, *Marxian Economics for the 21st Century: Revaluating Marx's Critique of Political Economy*
- Zhi Li, *The Concept of the Individual in the Thought of Karl Marx*
- Lelio Demichelis, *Marx, Alienation and Techno-capitalism*
- Dong-Min Rieu, *A Mathematical Approach to Marxian Value Theory: Time, Money, and Labor Productivity*
- Salvatore Prinzi, *Representation, Expression, and Institution: The Philosophy of Merleau-Ponty and Castoriadis*
- Agon Hamza, *Slavoj Žižek and the Reconstruction of Marxism*
- Éric Aunoble, *French Views on the Russian Revolution*
- Terrell Carver, Smail Rapić (Eds.), *Friedrich Engels for the 21st Century: Perspectives and Problems*
- Patrizia Dogliani, *A Political History of the International Union of Socialist Youth*
- Alexandros Chrysis, *The Marx of Communism: Setting Limits in the Realm of Communism*
- Paul Raekstad, *Karl Marx's Realist Critique of Capitalism: Freedom, Alienation, and Socialism*
- Alexis Cukier, *Democratic Work: Radical Democracy and the Future of Labour*
- Christoph Henning, *Theories of Alienation: From Rousseau to the Present*
- Daniel Egan, *Capitalism, War, and Revolution: A Marxist Analysis*
- Genevieve Ritchie, Sara Carpenter & Shahrzad Mojab (Eds.), *Marxism and Migration*

- Emanuela Conversano, *Capital from Afar: Anthropology and Critique of Political Economy in the Late Marx*
- Marcello Musto, *Rethinking Alternatives with Marx*
- Vincenzo Mele, *City and Modernity in George Simmel and Walter Benjamin: Fragments of Metropolis*
- David Norman Smith, *Self-Emancipation: Marx's Unfinished Theory of the Working Class*
- José Ricardo Villanueva Lira, *Marxism and the Origins of International Relations*
- Fabio Perocco (Ed.), *Racism in and for the Welfare State*
- Marcos Del Roio, *Gramsci and the Emancipation of the Subaltern Classes*
- Marcelo Badaró, *The Working Class from Marx to Our Times*
- Tomonaga Tairako, *A New Perspective on Marx's Philosophy and Political Economy*
- Matthias Bohlender, Anna-Sophie Schönfelder, & Matthias Spekker, *Truth and Revolution in Marx's Critique of Society*
- Mauricio Vieira Martins, *Marx, Spinoza and Darwin on Philosophy: Against Religious Perspectives of Transcendence*
- Jean Vigreux, Roger Martelli, & Serge Wolikow, *One Hundred Years of History of the French Communist Party*
- Aditya Nigam, *Border-Marxisms and Historical Materialism*
- Fred Moseley, *Marx's Theory of Value in Chapter 1 of Capital: A Critique of Heinrich's Value-Form Interpretation*
- Armando Boito, *The State, Politics, and Social Classes: Theory and History*
- Anjan Chakrabarti & Anup Dhar, *World of the Third and Hegemonic Capital: Between Marx and Freud*
- Hira Singh, *Annihilation of Caste in India: Ambedkar, Ghandi, and Marx*
- Salvatore Engel-Di Mauro, *An Introduction to Ecosocialism*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My colleague at Aarhus University, Professor Mikkel Thorup, has kindly read and commented initial drafts of the first chapters. Some sections of the following chapters began their lives long ago as small parts of my Ph.D. dissertation from 2007. Though hardly a sentence from that dissertation has survived in this book, my approach to these matters still benefits from discussions back then, particularly with my Ph.D. supervisor, former *lektor* Steen Busck and the assessment committee consisting of Professor Jan Ifversen, Aarhus University, *lektor* Uffe Jakobsen, University of Copenhagen, and the late Professor Thomas Krogh, University of Oslo. My writings on political theory, social revolution and utopianism since that time have carried such reflections on in continuous dialogue with far too many people to mention here. I am grateful to them all.

However, as always, the greatest assistance in writing this book has been the patience and enduring love of my closest family: Sonja, Rosa and Helene. Though they may never actually read this book, I dedicate it to them.

Aarhus, May 2022

Bertel Nygaard

# CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>Historicizing Marxism</b>	<b>1</b>
	<i>A Double Historicization</i>	3
<b>2</b>	<b>Revolution and the Surplus of History</b>	<b>9</b>
	<i>A Bourgeois Revolution</i>	10
	<i>Embryonic Anticapitalism</i>	14
	<i>Remembering for the Future</i>	17
	<i>The Surplus Meanings of History</i>	20
<b>3</b>	<b>Marx, Engels and Revolutionary History</b>	<b>25</b>
	<i>Historical Categories</i>	26
	<i>German Thought, the French Revolution and the Modern State</i>	29
	<i>Political and Social Temporalities</i>	34
	<i>A Heroic Bourgeoisie?</i>	37
	<i>Norm and Deviation</i>	39
	<i>Two Kinds of Poetry</i>	45
	<i>Bonapartism, State Autonomy and the Revolution as Process</i>	49
	<i>Revolution and the State in Marx's Critique of Political Economy</i>	53
	<i>Russian Times</i>	58
	<i>Historiography as Dialectical Abstractions</i>	60

<b>4</b>	<b>Marxism in Paris, 1889</b>	71
	<i>The Transnational Formation of Marxism—and Its German Centre</i>	74
	<i>Between Abstract Categories and Historical Studies</i>	78
	<i>German Marxism and the French Revolution</i>	80
	<i>Karl Kautsky Against Verflachung</i>	85
	<i>States and Classes in the Revolution</i>	88
	<i>The Agency of the Lower Classes</i>	91
	<i>Russia Between East and West</i>	95
	<i>Scandinavian Marxism and the Centenary</i>	100
	<i>A Marxist Marat in Malmö</i>	109
	<i>Ambiguities of Second International Marxism</i>	113
<b>5</b>	<b>Revisionist Synchronizations</b>	129
	<i>Revolutionary History and Eduard Bernstein's Revisionism</i>	130
	<i>Modern History from Liberalism to Socialism</i>	133
	<i>Expectations and Wagers</i>	134
	<i>Revolutions Between Democracy and Blanquism</i>	138
	<i>A Socialist History Between Orthodoxy and Revisionism</i>	142
	<i>Jaurès, Socialism and Marxism</i>	145
	<i>The Histoire Socialiste</i>	148
	<i>Bernstein for Jaurès</i>	150
	<i>Marxists Against Jaurès</i>	153
	<i>Scandinavia: Revisionism, Jauresianism and the French Revolution</i>	157
	<i>Revisionism and History</i>	164
<b>6</b>	<b>French Past, Russian Future</b>	173
	<i>Jacobin Bolshevism: Lenin</i>	175
	<i>Trotsky, Permanent Revolution and Revolutionary History</i>	179
	<i>Kautsky and the Actuality of Revolution</i>	183
	<i>Rosa Luxemburg and the Traditions of Proletarian Revolution</i>	190
	<i>Revolutionary Revisions</i>	194
<b>7</b>	<b>Reconfigurations</b>	201
<b>8</b>	<b>Appendix: Genealogies of 'Bourgeois Revolution'</b>	207
	<i>Bourgeois Historians and Their Revolution</i>	209
	<i>Enlightenment Theories</i>	212
	<i>Beyond the Bourgeois Predecessors</i>	214

<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>223</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>247</b>