

Female-Voice Song and Women's Musical Agency in the Middle Ages

Brill's Companions to the Musical Culture of Medieval and Early Modern Europe

VOLUME 5

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/bcmc*

Female-Voice Song and Women's Musical Agency in the Middle Ages

Edited by

Anna Kathryn Grau and Lisa Colton



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Evrart de Conty (d. 1405), Livre des échecs amoureux moralisés, illuminated by Robiné Testard (c. 1495–98). Gallica. Bibliothèque nationale de France. Département des Manuscrits. Français 143 fol. 65v ark:/12148/btv1b8426258c

The essay by David Catalunya has been supported by the MALMECC project, which is funded by the European Research Council; the ERC have provided funds to make his contribution Open Access. Link to project site <https://www.malmecc.eu/>.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Grau, Anna Kathryn, editor. | Colton, Lisa, editor.

Title: Female-voice song and women's musical agency in the middle ages / edited by Anna Kathryn Grau and Lisa Colton.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2022. | Series: Brill's companions to the musical culture of medieval and early modern Europe, 2214-9511 ; volume 5 | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022027001 (print) | LCCN 2022027002 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004429680 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004517035 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Vocal music--500-1400--History and criticism. | Church music--500-1400. | Women singers. | Women musicians. | Sex role in music.

Classification: LCC ML1402 .F46 2022 (print) | LCC ML1402 (ebook) | DDC 782.009/02--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022027001>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022027002>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2214-9511

ISBN 978-90-04-42968-0 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-51703-5 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands, except where stated otherwise.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements	IX
List of Figures, Tables and Music Examples	X
Notes on Contributors	XII

Introduction: Female Authorship, Female Voice, and Female-Voice Song	1
--	---

Anna Kathryn Grau and Lisa Colton

PART 1

Ritual Discourse

- 1 The Feminine Voice in the Early Islamicate Courts (661–1000) 17
Lisa Nielson
- 2 Music, Liturgy, and the Discursive Construction of Gender in a Thirteenth-Century Double Monastery 41
Lauren Purcell-Joiner
- 3 A Female-Voice Ceremonial from Medieval Castile 68
David Catalunya
- 4 Religious Reform and Liturgical Change in the Fifteenth Century: Chant as Women's Protest Music 91
Claire Taylor Jones

PART 2

Materiality

- 5 Beyond this Mist: Uncovering Material Multiplicities in *Amis, amis* 121
Rachel May Golden
- 6 Transmission of Female-Voice Motets in Late Thirteenth-Century Manuscripts 148
Anna Kathryn Grau
- 7 Chants for the Holy Trinity of Barking Abbey: Ethelburg, Hildelith, and Wulfhild 177
Anne Bagnall Yardley

PART 3

Subjectivity and Emotion

- 8 Handmade Women: The Manufacture of Femininity in the *Chansons de femme* 205
Helen Dell
- 9 The Voice of Emotion: Constructing an Identity for the Comtessa de Dia in Performance 235
Leah Stuttard
- 10 “Going all the Way with Marot”: Empowerment in the *Pastourelle* Motet *L'autrier m'esbatoie/Demenant grant joie/MANERE* 271
Lisa Colton
- 11 Sexuality, Pedagogy, and Women's Emotions in Middle English Songs 297
Carissa M. Harris
- 12 “Who cannot wepe come lerne at me”: Voicing Refrains in Late Medieval Passion Lyric 320
Melissa Tu

PART 4

Representation

- 13 A Song from the Mound: The Female Voice as a Repository for Genealogical Knowledge in *Hyndluljóð* 351
Annemari Ferreira
- 14 Eye, Mouth, and Heart: The Female-Voiced Contrafacta of *Can vei la lauzeta mover* 388
Meghan Quinlan
- 15 A Musical Letter from Eleanor of Provence to Margaret of Scotland: Patronage as Authorship in the Sequence *Ex te lux oritur* 422
Gillian L. Gower
- 16 Female Voice in the Trecento Song 457
Angelica Vomera

- 17 Saints and Sinners: The Representation of Women in Late-Medieval
English Carols 477
Louise McInnes
- Index 505

Acknowledgements

As co-editors, we have found it enjoyable and stimulating to work with a community of scholars across the world and from a variety of disciplines in writing this book. Our warmest thanks go to the commissioning editor Kate Hammond, and to Brill, for their support and encouragement. We wish to acknowledge the time, expertise, and imagination of all the authors in this study. It has been a particular pleasure for us to publish a collection that includes contributions by scholars whose work has inspired our own, as well as by writers at various stages of their academic career. We hope it will encourage further work on the important subjects of female-voice song and women's musical agency.

We would like to thank the following bodies who have supported parts of this book. The research leading the essay by David Catalunya received funding from the European Research Council in the context of the project *Music and Late Medieval European Court Cultures* of the University of Oxford (European Union Horizon 2020 Research and Innovation Program, Grant no. 669190). The image in Anne Bagnall Yardley's essay is reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library. Manuscript images in Gillian Gower's chapter, from Uppsala University Library (Uppsala Universitetsbiblioteket), are in the public domain, but we wish to acknowledge the University of Uppsala for making them available for reproduction.

Much of the book was written and edited during the challenges created by the Covid-19 pandemic in 2020; we recognise the immense personal, financial, and institutional pressures experienced by authors during this time, and are grateful for their continued commitment to the project. We also benefitted from the particular ways in which libraries and archives made materials available to authors at a time when many were closed to the public. Lisa would like to offer thanks to the support of her family: Heidi, Gracie, and Brandon. Anna is grateful for the support of her family: Thomas, Charlotte, and Hugo.

Figures, Tables and Music Examples

Figures

- 3.1 Ground Plan of the Las Huelgas Abbey Church (Eastern half). Reconstruction of the state c.1300. © David Catalunya 73
- 3.2 *Libro de la coronación*, fol. 29v, maidens singing a *cantiga* inside the church. © Patrimonio Nacional 77
- 7.1 Cambridge University Library, Dd.12.56, fol. 167r. Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library 178
- 9.1 Chansonnier Méry de Vic, p. 174, portrait of the Comtessa de Dia with *vida* (public domain) 239
- 12.1 Detail from Manchester, John Rylands Library, Lat. 395, fol. 120r. Copyright of the University of Manchester 329
- 12.2 Detail from Cambridge, Trinity College, O.9.38, fol. 63v. Reproduced with permission of the Master and Fellows of Trinity College, Cambridge 330
- 14.1 Rome, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Chigiani C. V. 151, fol. 77v (olim 74v) © 2021 Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana. Reproduced by permission of Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana with all rights reserved 415
- 14.2 Rome, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Chigiani C. V. 151 fol. 78r (olim 75r) © 2021 Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana. Reproduced by permission of Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana with all rights reserved 416
- 15.1 *Ex te lux oritur*, Uppsala MS C 233, fols. 50v–51r 432
- 15.2 *Nobilis humilis*, Uppsala MS C 233, fols. 19v–20r 433

Tables

- 2.1 Song of Songs antiphon series 58
- 2.2 Separation of parts among musical forces in Latin 62
- 6.1 Central thirteenth-century motet sources 154
- 9.1 *A chantar* form, as performed by Qnta 260
- 14.1 Sources of *Can vei* and its contrafacta 400
- 15.1 Contents of Uppsala Universitetsbiblioteket MS C 233 428
- 15.2 Scribal hands in Uppsala Universitetsbibliothek MS C 233 430
- 15.3 The *ars dictaminis* scheme set forth in in *Ex te lux oritur* 445
- 17.1 Greene's "Carols of Women," as contained in R. L. Greene, *The Early English Carols* (Oxford, 1977) 479

Music Examples

- 4.1 *Revelabunt caeli*, ninth Matins responsory on Holy Thursday and penultimate responsory of the Dominican altar washing ceremony. Austin, Harry Ransom Center, MS 21, fols. 24v–26r 106
- 5.1 *Amis, amis*, Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fr. 12483 (ed. Golden) 139
- 6.1 *Amours qui vient / Toute soule / NOTUM*, Staatsbibliothek, Bamberg, Lit. 115, fol. 58r–v (ed. Grau) 168
- 6.2 Resemblance of MISIT tenor melody to “Toute seule passerai” refrain (ed. Grau) 170
- 8.1 *La douce voiz*, Bibliothèque de l’Arsenal MS 5198 réserve, fol. 99r–99v (ed. Grau) 222
- 8.2 *Soufres maris*, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Reg. lat. 1490, fol. 108v (ed. Grau) 223
- 9.1 *A chantar* transcribed from MS W, fol. 204r–v following the “Frenchified” text as transcribed by Pollina, 1988. Musical structure indicated by capital letters (ed. Stuttard) 245
- 9.2a *A chantar* extract from the performance by Brigitte Lesne on the album *Ave Eva*, 1995 (transcribed and ed. by Stuttard); Harp introduction and opening of Strophe I 254
- 9.2b *A chantar* extract from the performance by Brigitte Lesne on the album *Ave Eva*, 1995 (transcribed and ed. by Stuttard); Opening of Strophe IV (third performed strophe) 255
- 9.2c *A chantar* extract from the performance by Brigitte Lesne on the album *Ave Eva*, 1995 (transcribed and ed. by Stuttard); Opening of Strophe V (fourth performed strophe) 256
- 10.1 *L'autrier m'esbatoie / Demenant grant joie / MANERE* (ed. Colton) 279
- 14.1 Comparative transcription of *Can vei* and its contrafacta 397
- 14.2 Music, text, and translation of *Plaine d'ire* 404
- 14.3 Pitch and intervallic contour of *Plaine d'ire* 405
- 14.4 Text and Music of *Amis* 410
- 15.1 *Ex te lux oritur* (ed. Gower) 437

Notes on Contributors

David Catalunya

is a post-doctoral researcher at the University of Oxford, and a member of the project MALMECC (Music and Late Medieval Court Culture) funded by the European Research Council. Earlier he worked at the Institut für Musikforschung of the University of Würzburg in Germany, where he served as an editor of individual volumes of the series *Corpus Monodicum*. His scholarly research embraces a wide range of topics in music and culture from the central Middle Ages to the Early Modern period, including manuscript studies, gender studies, art history, organology, and music theory.

Lisa Colton

is Professor of Musicology at the University of Huddersfield. Her monograph, *Angel Song: Medieval English Music in History* (Routledge, 2017), offered fresh perspectives on the study of insular music before 1500, including on the career of John Dunstaple. Colton's research focuses on British and French music from the Middle Ages, as well as with aspects of popular and classical repertoire from the twentieth century.

Helen Dell

is an honorary research fellow in the School of Culture and Communication at the University of Melbourne. Her core research is in the field of medieval song. Dell's PhD was published as *Desire by Gender and Genre in Trouvère Song* (D. S. Brewer, 2008). She also conducts research into medievalism, especially musical medievalism; her chapter 'Musical Medievalism and the Harmony of the Spheres' appeared in the *Cambridge Companion to Medievalism* (Cambridge University Press, 2016). She has co-edited and contributed to a special issue of *postmedieval* entitled 'Music, Emotion, Medievalism' (2019).

Annemari Ferreira

is an assistant professor of English as a Foreign Language at Woosong University, South Korea. She holds a research fellowship at Africa Open: Institute for Music, Research and Innovation, Stellenbosch University, South Africa and is the co-editor of *Old Norse Poetry in Performance* (Routledge, 2021). Her research continues to engage with early medieval literatures that provide rich source material for the study of politically-rooted cultural discourse.

Rachel May Golden

is Associate Professor of Musicology in the School of Music at the University of Tennessee. She is author of *Mapping Medieval Identities in Occitanian Crusade Song* (Oxford University Press, 2020). Her work has appeared in *The Journal of Musicology*, *Music & Letters*, *Musical Quarterly*, and *Opera Quarterly*, among other publications. She has been an American Council of Learned of Societies Fellow and an NEH Summer Scholar. Her primary research embraces experiential and cultural aspects of medieval music of the twelfth century, including issues of monastic devotion, gendered expression, regional identities, and words-music relationships.

Gillian L. Gower

is a Visiting Teaching Assistant Professor of Musicology at the University of Denver and an Honorary Research Fellow at the University of Edinburgh. She received a BA from Johns Hopkins University, an MA from Hunter College, and a PhD in Musicology from the University of California, Los Angeles. A specialist in gender and medieval sacred music, her research centers on queenship, religion, and music in England and Scotland, 1200–1500. She has also published essays on gender and race in medievalist popular culture. Other scholarly interests include critical historiography, paleography, and digital humanities.

Anna Kathryn Grau

is Music & Performing Arts Librarian and lecturer at the University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee. Her research focuses on gender and manuscript culture in 13th-century France, as well as information literacy instruction in the arts. Her recent work on gender in medieval French song appears in the volumes *The Musical World of Adam de la Halle* (ed. Jennifer Saltzstein) and *Gender & Voice in Medieval French Literature and Song* (ed. Katherine Kong and Rachel Golden).

Carissa M. Harris

is Associate Professor of English at Temple University in Philadelphia. She is the author of *Obscene Pedagogies: Transgressive Talk and Sexual Education in Late Medieval Britain* (Cornell University Press, 2018). She has also published essays on medieval rape narratives, manuscripts, neglected obscene riddles, Middle English pregnancy laments, alehouse culture, intoxication and consent, women's anger in the Philomela legend, and the history of the word 'fuck'.

Louise McInnes

is an independent musicologist and instrumental teacher whose PhD on the late medieval carol (University of Huddersfield, 2014) has stimulated a number of publications. She has worked as an associate Lecturer at the University of Huddersfield, held an Honorary Research Fellowship in Music at the University of Sheffield, and completed a research study for the University of Durham. In addition to her work in music, she has a background in academic skills and undergraduate research development.

Lisa Nielson

is an historical musicologist whose research focuses on gender, sexuality, and social status of musicians in the medieval Islamicate courts. She is the inaugural Anisfield-Wolf SAGES Fellow and appointed as a Lecturer in the Department of Music at Case Western Reserve University. Nielson has received numerous awards for teaching, mentoring, and advocacy, and has published several articles on music and musicians in the medieval Islamicate world. Her book, *Music and Musicians in the Medieval Islamicate World: A Social History*, was published by Bloomsbury (2021).

Lauren Purcell-Joiner's

doctoral dissertation, 'Veil and Tonsure: Stuttgart 95, Devotional Music, and the Discursive Construction of Gender in Thirteenth-Century Double Houses' (University of Oregon, 2017) provided the first, full-scale musicological evaluation of Stuttgart 95.

Megan Quinlan

is a postdoctoral research fellow at the Department of Musicology, Uppsala University, Sweden, as well as a choral conductor and performer of medieval song. She gained her doctorate from the University of Oxford in 2017 with a dissertation on the rich contexts of *trouvère* contrafacta. Her published work includes articles in *Music & Letters*, *Early Music*, and *The Bloomsbury Cultural History of Music*, and she serves on the editorial board of the Swedish cultural magazine *Signum*.

Leah Stuttard

first fell in love with medieval music listening to it on records that she purchased from the local library when they were put out of circulation. After studies at the Schola Cantorum in Basel, Switzerland, at the Sorbonne in Paris, and almost twenty years as a professional medieval harpist, she is currently pursuing her doctorate at the University of Huddersfield (funded by NECAH), investigating improvisation practices in the medieval music revival.

Claire Taylor Jones

is Associate Professor of German and a Fellow of the Medieval Institute at the University of Notre Dame. Her research focuses on the reform of religious orders in late-medieval Germany. She has published a monograph (*Ruling the Spirit*, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018) and a book-length translation (*Women's History in the Age of Reformation*, PIMS, 2019) on German Dominican nuns in the late -medieval Observant reform movement. Her research has been supported by the DAAD, the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, the Notre Dame Institute for Advanced Study, and the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation.

Melissa Tu

received a B.A. in Comparative Literature from Princeton University, where she graduated *summa cum laude* and was awarded the Joseph R. Strayer Prize in Medieval Studies. She then completed an M.Phil. in Medieval and Renaissance Literature at Cambridge University. Melissa is currently a Ph.D. candidate in the English Department at Yale University. Her research focuses on the ways that lyric poems of late-medieval England engage with notions of voice, speaker identity, and sense perception.

Angelica Vomera

gained her PhD in *Lettere/Scienze du langage* (UniTo/Sorbonne Nouvelle Paris 3) with a dissertation focused on the edition of the texts of the *Ars Subtilior* Codex Boverio (Torino, Biblioteca Nazionale, T.III.2). Vomera's research is concerned with making linguistic and literary studies of vocal music of the later Middle Ages, especially that of Italy and France.

Anne Bagnall Yardley

is the author of *Performing Piety: Musical Culture in Medieval English Nunneries* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2006), as well as numerous articles in the field of medieval music and liturgy. Yardley taught at the University of Illinois and at Drew University (Madison, NJ), where she served as the Associate Academic Dean in the Theological School. She received her B.A. from Whitman College in Walla Walla Washington and her PhD from Columbia University. She is now retired from teaching and enjoying time to focus on her scholarship.