

Heritage Destruction, Human Rights and International Law

Heritage Destruction, Human Rights and International Law

Edited by

Amy Strecker and Joseph Powderly



BRILL | NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Architecture and landscape of Hasankeyf, Eastern Turkey. Pascal Mannaerts/Alamy Stock Photo.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023010737>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISBN 978-90-04-43399-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-43401-1 (e-book)

Copyright 2023 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands, except where stated otherwise.
Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress and Wageningen Academic.
Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements VII
Notes on Contributors IX

Introduction

*Heritage Destruction, Human Rights, and International Law in Times
of Conflict and in Peace* 1

Amy Strecker and Joseph Powderly

- 1 Is International Law Ready for the Recognition of a General Obligation
to Prevent and Avoid Destruction of Cultural Heritage? 19
Francesco Francioni
- 2 The Genealogy of 'Universality' within Cultural Heritage Law 42
Sophie Starrenburg
- 3 Grave Crimes: Conservation, Conflict and Criminality in Timbuktu 68
Lynn Meskell
- 4 Heritage Destruction as a Collective Harm
Challenges and Pitfalls of International Cultural Justice 84
Andrzej Jakubowski
- 5 Intentional Destruction of Cultural Heritage
Sentencing and Reparations 112
Ana Filipa Vrdoljak
- 6 Responding to the Destruction of Intangible Cultural Heritage
in Situations of Armed Conflict: What International Law to Apply? 142
Janet Blake
- 7 Toward a Human Rights-Based Approach as an Element in Post-conflict
Cultural Heritage Reconstruction 165
Patty Gerstenblith
- 8 Cultural Heritage Losses in Peacetime
Challenges and Lingering Questions 195
Alessandro Chechi

- 9 Balancing Economic Interests with Cultural Preservation
in Development Contexts
Insight into the Meaning of "Imperatives of Development" 233
 Berenika Drazewska

- 10 Right to Cultural Life: Panacea or Problem? 259
 Lucas Lixinski

- 11 The Destruction of Indigenous Peoples' Heritage and International
Law 283
 Federico Lenzerini

- 12 Environmental Law Principles and Heritage: An Australian
Perspective 312
 Ben Boer

- 13 Beyond Sovereignty: Tara, the M3, and Access to Justice for Cultural
Landscape Destruction in Ireland 348
 Amy Strecker and Conor Newman

- 14 Virtual Enclosure, Spatial Injustice and Heritage Destruction
in the Caribbean
The Case of Camerhogne Park, Grenada 376
 Amanda Byer

- 15 The Notion of 'Heritage Title' for Contested Cultural Objects 391
 Evelien Campfens

- Afterword
Heritage Destruction and the War on Ukraine 423
 Joseph Powderly and Amy Strecker

- Bibliography 455
- Index 497

Acknowledgements

This edited volume is the culmination of a project initiated by the authors in 2017. The idea for the project stemmed from a shared observation that while notorious acts of heritage destruction in the context of armed conflict were garnering headlines and global attention, equally destructive and detrimental acts and policies, occurring outside of the context of armed conflict, were taking place on a day-to-day basis but were being met with comparative silence. Our objective was to bring together a diverse range of scholars who would reflect on both of these contexts – heritage destruction in armed conflict and heritage destruction in peacetime – through the shared lens of international law, and human rights law more generally. We were particularly conscious of the opportunity presented by the project to exploit the inherent inter-disciplinarity of the subject and to bring together international law scholars, heritage scholars, anthropologists, and archeologists to discuss heritage destruction through a nuanced and critical lens. With the generous support of the Leiden Global Interactions Fund, the Leiden-Delft-Erasmus Centre for Global Heritage and Development, and the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies, we convened and hosted an international symposium in Leiden in May 2018 on the topic of *Heritage Destruction, Human Rights, and International Law*. The papers presented and workshopped over the course of that three-day symposium form the basis of this volume.

We are extremely fortunate that some of the leading scholars working in the area of international cultural heritage law and practice agreed to participate in the international symposium and to contribute to this volume. We thank our wonderful contributors not only for their scholarship, but most particularly for their patience. The completion of this volume was impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic and the resultant medium and long-term consequences that many of us have had to deal with. We are grateful that despite the numerous delays, they have maintained their faith and confidence that this volume would come to fruition.

We would also like to sincerely thank a number of individuals for their editorial assistance in bringing this volume to completion: Rafael Braga da Silva, Paula Baldini Miranda da Cruz, Eva de Dorsthorst, Deannie Yap, Rashid Ahmad, Brianna Dyer, and Maria Manuela Marquez Velasquez.

Finally, we are grateful to Brill/Nijhoff, and in particular, Lindy Melman, Bea Timmer, and Anita Opdam, for sharing the vision for this volume and for their assistance throughout the publication process.

Amy Strecker

Dublin

Joseph Powderly

The Hague

November 2022

Notes on Contributors

Janet Blake

is Associate Professor of Law and Head of the Human Rights Law Department at the University of Shahid Beheshti (Tehran) where she teaches International, Environmental and Human Rights Law. She is a member of the Centre of Excellence for Education for Sustainable Development, based at the university, and a member of the Cultural Heritage Law Committee of the International Law Association since 2012. Dr Blake has acted as an International Consultant to UNESCO since 1999, mostly in the field of intangible cultural heritage and in developing, drafting, and implementing the 2003 Convention on that question. Since 2015, she has been a Global Facilitator for UNESCO's Capacity – building under the 2003 Convention and has provided advice at governmental level on developing national law and policy for ICH safeguarding. She has published several books and articles (in English and Persian) including her research monograph on International Cultural Heritage Law (OUP 2015) and a co-edited Commentary on UNESCO's 2003 Convention (OUP 2020).

Ben Boer

is Emeritus Professor at the University of Sydney and National Distinguished Professor at Wuhan University Law School in Hubei Province China, in its Research Institute of Environmental Law. Between 2006 and 2008, he was the international Co-Director of the IUCN (International Union for the Conservation of Nature) Academy of Environmental Law and Visiting Professor based at the University of Ottawa. Formerly, Ben was Professor in Environmental Law, University of Sydney (1997–2008) and the Corrs Chambers Westgarth Professor of Environmental Law, University of Sydney (1992–1996). He was appointed as Deputy Chair of the IUCN World Commission on Environmental Law in 2012, a position he held until 2016. He became a member of the Australian Academy of Law in 2016 and continues to be a member of the International Council of Environmental Law, based in Geneva.

Amanda Byer

is a senior postdoctoral researcher within an ERC-funded project PROPERTY [IN] JUSTICE based at the Sutherland School of Law, University College Dublin. She holds an LLM in Environmental Law from University College London and a Ph.D in cultural heritage law from Leiden University. Amanda's research interests lie at the intersection of land, law and spatial justice, with particular reference to small island developing states. Her doctoral dissertation involved a

legal geographical analysis of heritage, planning and environmental laws in the English-speaking Lesser Antilles, with an eye to the wider relevance of heritage resources to sustainable development (published as a monograph with Sidestone Press in 2022). The research considered the importance of local relationships with heritage to community cohesion and livelihoods and looked to the use of procedural environmental rights (PER) to protect heritage resources via the protection of landscape, something she developed while she was a Hauser Global Post-doctoral Fellow at New York University, prior to taking up her current position at UCD.

Evelien Campfens

is a cultural heritage law specialist and post-doctoral fellow at the Research Group 'Museums Collections and Society' at Leiden University. After having worked as a lawyer at the Dutch Restitutions Committee for Nazi looted art (2001–2016) she joined Leiden University (Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies) to conduct her Ph.D research on the topic of looted art. She is an elected member of the Committee on Participation in Global Cultural Heritage Governance of the International Law Association; a research coordinator of the Heritage Under Threat group of the LDE Centre for Global Heritage and Development; and a member of the Ethics Committee of the Dutch Museum Association (Ethische Codecommissie). Evelien has published widely on issues relating to the restitution and return of cultural objects.

Alessandro Chechi

is a senior researcher and lecturer at the University of Geneva (Faculty of Law), and lecturer in Public International Law at the Université Catholique of Lille (Faculty of Law). Alessandro serves as a member of the editorial boards of the Italian Yearbook of International Law and of the Santander Art and Culture Law Review. He was consultant for the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC) of the Council of Europe for the revision of the Convention on Offences Relating to Cultural Property. He is the author of *The Settlement of International Cultural Heritage Disputes* (OUP 2014) and several articles and book chapters on matters of cultural heritage law.

Berenika Drazewska

is the Dorset Researcher in Public International Law at BIICL and Affiliate Researcher at the CAIDG at SMU in Singapore, where she is currently based. She holds an LL.M and a Ph.D in international cultural heritage law from the European University Institute. Her doctoral thesis examined the concept of military necessity in the context of protection of cultural heritage during

armed conflicts. In 2016/2017, she was a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University, where she worked on issues of global cultural governance and accountability. Dr Drazewska is currently a member of the Heritage Council of the NGO For All Moonkind (Permanent Observer to the UNCOPUOS) working towards ensuring the preservation of human heritage in outer space. She is also a member of ESIL (International Law of Culture IG). Dr Drazewska's research interests include protection of cultural heritage, human rights and cultural governance. Her monograph, *Military Necessity in International Cultural Heritage Law*, was published in 2021 (Brill Nijhoff).

Francesco Francioni

is Professor Emeritus of International Law at the European University Institute, Florence and Professor of International Cultural Heritage Law at LUISS University, Rome. He is a member of the Institut de Droit International, a member of the editorial board of the Italian Yearbook of International Law, as well as the co-founder and General Editor with Ana Vrdoljak of the Oxford University Press Series "Cultural Heritage Law and Policy". He has been a member of the Italian delegation in numerous international negotiations and diplomatic conferences for the adoption of treaties in the field of environmental protection and cultural heritage, and served as President of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee 1997-1998. He has also been Judge ad hoc at the UN Tribunal of the Law of the Sea and arbitrator at the Permanent Court of Arbitration (The Hague). Francesco has published extensively in the field of Public International Law in English, Italian and French and has been visiting professor at Oxford University (1998-2003), Columbia Law School (Winter term 2013), Cornell Law School (1984, 1985, 1986), and Texas Law School from 1987 to 2008.

Patty Gerstenblith

is Distinguished Research Professor of Law at DePaul University and Director of its Center for Art, Museum & Cultural Heritage Law. She was appointed by both President Obama and President Clinton to the Cultural Property Advisory Committee in the Department of State. She was an Expert for the Fulbright Specialist Project at the Department of Antiquities of Jordan in 2019, and is a Research Associate at the University of Pennsylvania Museum of Anthropology and Archaeology and a member of the editorial board of the journal *Art, Antiquity and Law*. She lectures and publishes widely on the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict and the international trade in art and antiquities. Her casebook, *Art, Cultural Heritage and the Law*, is

currently in its fourth edition. Gerstenblith received her BA from Bryn Mawr College, her Ph.D in art history and anthropology from Harvard University, her JD from Northwestern University and an honorary Doctorate of Humane Letters from Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion.

Andrzej Jakubowski

is Assistant Professor at the University of Opole (Poland) where he is leading a three – year research project ‘Legal forms of cultural heritage governance in Europe – a comparative law perspective’. He is also a visiting research fellow at the Amsterdam Centre of International Law (University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands). Andrzej holds master’s degrees in law and art history from the University of Warsaw (Poland), and a Ph.D in international law from the European University Institute in Florence (Italy). He serves as Chair of the Committee on Participation in Global Cultural Heritage Governance of the International Law Association and Deputy Editor – in – Chief of the *Santander Art and Culture Law Review*. He has authored inter alia *State Succession in Cultural Property* (OUP 2015), edited *Cultural Rights as Collective Rights: An International Law Perspective* (Brill Nijhoff 2016), and co – edited *Cultural Heritage in the European Union: A Critical Inquiry into Law and Policy* (Brill Nijhoff 2019).

Federico Lenzerini

is Professor of International Law and Human Rights at the Department of Political and International Sciences of the University of Siena (Italy). He is also Professor at the LLM programme in Intercultural Human Rights at the St. Thomas University School of Law, Miami (FL), and Professor at the Tulane – Siena Summer School on International Law, Cultural Heritage and the Arts. He has been Consultant to UNESCO and Counsel to the Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs for international negotiations related to cultural heritage, as well as the Rapporteur of two ILA Committees on the rights of indigenous peoples and member of the ILA Committee on Cultural Heritage Law. His main fields of research are protection of the rights of indigenous peoples, protection of cultural heritage, human rights and refugee law. He has published about 120 academic works on these and other topics.

Lucas Lixinski

is a Professor at the Faculty of Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney. Prior to joining UNSW, he was a Postgraduate Fellow at the Bernard and Audre Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas School of Law. He holds a Ph.D in law from the European University Institute (EUI, Italy), an

LLM in human rights law from Central European University (CEU, Hungary), and an LLB from the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS, Brazil). He is Vice-President (Conference) of the Association of Critical Heritage Studies, and Rapporteur of the International Law Association Committee on Participation in Global Cultural Heritage Governance. He sits on the editorial board of the *International Journal of Heritage Studies* and the *Santander Art and Culture Law Review*, among others, and has published widely on the topics of cultural heritage law, communities, and human rights.

Lynn Meskell

is Richard D. Green Professor of Anthropology in the School of Arts and Sciences, Professor in the Graduate Program in Historic Preservation, and curator in the Middle East and Asia sections at the Penn Museum. She is currently A.D. White Professor-at-Large at Cornell University (2019–2025), and holds Honorary Professorships at Oxford University and Liverpool University, Shiv Nadar University, India and the University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa. Previously, Meskell was the Shirley and Leonard Ely Professor of Humanities and Sciences in the Department of Anthropology at Stanford University. She is a Fellow of the Australian Academy of the Humanities and founding editor of the *Journal of Social Archaeology*. Her most recent book, *A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage, and the Dream of Peace* (OUP 2018), reveals UNESCO's early forays into a one – world archaeology and its later commitments to global heritage. Her new fieldwork explores monumental regimes of research and preservation around World Heritage sites in India and how diverse actors and agencies address the needs of living communities.

Conor Newman

is a Senior lecturer in archaeology at the School of Geography, Archaeology and Irish Studies, at the University of Galway, Ireland, and acting director of the Centre for Landscape Studies based at the Moore Institute. He directed the Discovery Programme's archaeological survey of Tara and has published extensively on the subject. Conor is a co-founder of the international project *Making Europe: Columbanus and His Legacy*. He has been visiting professor of Celtic archaeology at the University of Toronto, and in 2011 was awarded the British Academy's John Coles Medal for Landscape Archaeology. He was the chairman of the Irish Heritage Council 2008–16, and currently serves on the Executive Board of UNISCAPE – the network of universities for the implementation of the European Landscape Convention.

Joseph Powderly

is Associate Professor of Public International Law at the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies, Leiden University where in teaches in the areas of international criminal law, international human rights law, and public international law. He is the author of *Judges and the Making of International Criminal Law* (Brill Nijhoff 2020) and many journal articles and chapters on subjects related to international criminal law, international human rights law, and international cultural heritage law. He is a former Managing Editor of *Criminal Law Forum* and is currently an Editorial Board Member of the *Leiden Journal of International Law*. He is a member of the Management Board of the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies, and acts as the Centre's Director of Ph.D Studies.

Sophie Starrenburg

is completing her Ph.D at the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies, prior to which she was a teaching/research staff member at the Centre. She was awarded the NWO Research Talent grant to conduct her Ph.D research, which focuses on the foundations of cultural heritage protection in public international law – striking a balance between local and global interests through human rights. Prior to her doctoral studies, Sophie graduated cum laude from her degree at Leiden, and went on to pursue a second LLM at the University of Cambridge as a Rotary Scholar. She graduated with First Class honours and was awarded the de Hart Prize in Law from Christ's College. During her time at Cambridge she was also an editor for the *Cambridge International Law Journal*.

Amy Strecker

is Associate Professor at the Sutherland School of Law, University College Dublin, and PI of an ERC-funded research project investigating the role of international law in facilitating spatial justice and injustice through its conceptualisation of property rights in land [PROPERTY[IN]JUSTICE]. A continuous thread throughout her work has been the problem of access to justice for communities in landscape and heritage destruction. Before joining UCD, Amy was an Assistant Professor at Leiden University (Faculty of Archaeology and later LUC, The Hague, where she taught various courses on international cultural heritage law, human rights and international justice) and was involved in an ERC project investigating the impact of colonial encounters on the Caribbean. She is the author of *Landscape Protection in International Law* (OUP 2018), two co-edited collections and several book chapters and journal articles on the role of law in multiple aspects of cultural heritage governance and landscape related rights. Amy is a branch officer of the International Law

Association – Irish branch and editorial board member of the International Journal of Cultural Property.

Ana Filipa Vrdoljak

is a Professor of Law, Faculty of Law and UNESCO Chair of International Law and Cultural Heritage at the University of Technology Sydney and visiting professor, Renmin Law School, Beijing. She is the author of *International Law, Museums and the Return of Cultural Objects* (CUP 2006) and editor of the *Oxford Handbook on International Cultural Heritage Law* with Francesco Francioni (OUP 2020), *The Cultural Dimension of Human Rights* (OUP 2013) and *International Law for Common Goods: Normative Perspectives in Human Rights, Culture and Nature* with Federico Lenzerini (Hart Publishing 2014). She is co-General Editor of the Oxford University Press book series *Cultural Heritage Law and Policy*, and *Commentaries on International Cultural Heritage Law*, as well as Advisory Board member of the *International Journal of Cultural Property*, and President of the International Cultural Property Society.

