

## Quantifying Aristotle

# Medieval and Early Modern Philosophy and Science

*Editors*

C.H. Lüthy (*Radboud University*)  
P.J.J.M. Bakker (*Radboud University*)

*Editorial Consultants*

Joël Biard (*University of Tours*)  
Simo Knuuttila (*University of Helsinki*)  
Jürgen Renn (*Max-Planck-Institute for the History of Science*)  
Theo Verbeek (*University of Utrecht*)

VOLUME 34

The titles published in this series are listed at [brill.com/memps](http://brill.com/memps)

# Quantifying Aristotle

*The Impact, Spread and Decline of the  
Calculatores Tradition*

*Edited by*

Daniel A. Di Liscia  
Edith D. Sylla

*With the collaboration of*

Paul J.J.M Bakker



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Portrait of Nicole Oresme. Ms. Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fr. 565, 1<sup>r</sup> (detail).

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Di Liscia, Daniel A., editor. | Sylla, Edith Dudley, editor. | Bakker, Paul J. J. M.

Title: Quantifying Aristotle : the impact, spread, and decline of the Calculatores Tradition / edited by Daniel A. Di Liscia, Edith D. Sylla ; with the collaboration of Paul J.J.M Bakker.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2022. | Series: Medieval and early modern quantifying Aristotle philosophy and science, 2468-6808 ; volume 34 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022011340 (print) | LCCN 2022011341 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004499829 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004512054 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Aristotle. | Philosophy, Medieval. | Science, Medieval. | Science--Philosophy.

Classification: LCC B725 .Q36 2022 (print) | LCC B725 (ebook) |

DDC 185--dc23/eng/20220503

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022011340>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022011341>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: [brill.com/brill-typeface](https://brill.com/brill-typeface).

ISSN 2468-6808

ISBN 978-90-04-49982-9 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-51205-4 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Daniel A. Di Liscia and Edith D. Sylla. Published by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill nv reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via [brill.com](https://brill.com) or [copyright.com](https://copyright.com).

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

# Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
List of Figures	VIII
Notes on Contributors	IX

Introduction	1
<i>Daniel A. Di Liscia</i>	

1	Thomas Wylton on the Ceasing of an Instant of Time	20
	<i>Cecilia Trifogli</i>	
2	The New Interpretation of Aristotle: Richard Kilvington, Thomas Bradwardine, and the New Rule of Motion	37
	<i>Elżbieta Jung</i>	
3	The <i>Opuscula de motu</i> Ascribed to Richard Swineshead: The Testimony of the Ongoing Development of the Oxford Calculators' Science of Motion	80
	<i>Robert Podkoński</i>	
4	Calculations in Thomas Bradwardine's <i>De causa dei</i> , Book I	106
	<i>Edit Anna Lukács</i>	
5	The Calculators on the Insolubles: Bradwardine, Kilvington, Heytesbury, Swyneshed, and Dumbleton	126
	<i>Stephen Read</i>	
6	The Influence of the Oxford <i>Calculatores</i> on the Understanding of Local Motion: The Example of the <i>Tractatus de sex inconvenientibus</i>	153
	<i>Sabine Rommevaux-Tani</i>	
7	Wyclif, the Black Sheep of the Oxford Calculators	186
	<i>Mark Thakkar</i>	
8	On the Reception of English Logic at Universities of Central Europe: Helmoldus de Zoltwedel (Prague, Leipzig) on the Liar-Paradox	215
	<i>Harald Berger</i>	

- 9 Blasius of Parma on the Calculation of the Variation of Qualities and Aristotelian Physics 232  
*Joël Biard*
- 10 The Calculators' Tradition in Oresme's *De visione stellarum* 255  
*Aníbal Szapiro*
- 11 Perfections and Latitudes: The Development of the Calculators' Tradition and the Geometrisation of Metaphysics and Theology 278  
*Daniel A. Di Liscia*
- 12 Decline of the Calculators in Paris c. 1500: Humanism and Print 328  
*Richard J. Oosterhoff*
- 13 Some Aspects of the 'Rules' of *motus difformis* in Angelo da Fossambruno's Commentary on Heytesbury's *De tribus praedicamentis* 352  
*Fabio Seller*
- 14 Leibniz and the Calculators 381  
*Edith D. Sylla*
- Manuscripts 427
- Bibliography 430
- Index Nominum 470

# Acknowledgements

It is my pleasant duty to thank a series of institutions and persons who, in one way or another, made possible the 2018 Munich conference, as well as the present publication. First of all, I would like to mention my 'home institute', the *Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy* (MCMP) of the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, which provided us with all the necessary assistance in organisational matters. Besides, it was a pleasure to collaborate on this occasion with the *Lehrstuhl für Wissenschaftsgeschichte* of the same university. Special thanks should be addressed to the *Fritz Thyssen Stiftung* for its generous financial support of the meeting. I would also like to express my gratitude to Linda Grohmann for her valuable help with the production of the complex bibliography and a first formal verification of the chapters. I very much appreciate that Paul Bakker and Christoph Lüthy have welcomed this book to the prestigious series *Medieval and Early Modern Philosophy and Science*. Special thanks go to Paul Bakker for his accurate work as collaborator of this volume and for his engagement with the various aspects connected with the realisation of this project.

My warmest gratitude goes to my co-editor, Edith D. Sylla, for her dedicated and precious work on this volume. It is no secret that Edith Sylla more than anyone else is the person we all identify with this research topic, the *Calculatores*, a topic to which she contributed for many decades at the highest level of quality. Hence, not only is it a great honour for me that she accepted to participate in the conference and publication, setting the crown on this volume with a ground-breaking paper on Leibniz and his calculatory background. It was also a great relief for me that she was happy to assume the task of being co-editor of the present volume. She has read all the papers with her usual accuracy and provided many improvements to many of them. I am grateful for her kind corrections, suggestions, and various improvements.

*Daniel A. Di Liscia*

Munich / Copenhagen, October 2021.

# Figures

- 10.1 Atmospheric refraction according to Ptolemy 259
- 10.2 A ray of light passing through two media with different densities 261
- 10.3 First experience supporting atmospheric refraction according to Oresme 263
- 10.4 Second experience supporting atmospheric refraction according to Oresme 264
- 10.5 Third experience supporting atmospheric refraction according to Oresme 265
- 10.6 Oresme's diagram to prove refraction in a uniform difform medium 268
- 10.7 Refractions in the partitions of the hour, according to Oresme's speculation 271
- 10.8 Implications of considering representation of time in Oresme's diagram 274
- 10.9 Oresme's speculation represented in perspective 275
- 11.1 A reconstruction of a representation system mentioned by Jacques Legrand 304
- 11.2 The beginning of the text until now called *Tractatus bonus* in manuscript København, Kongelige Bibliothek, Ms. Ny kgl. saml. 190 4<sup>o</sup> 308
- 11.3 Representations used in the *Metaphysics* commentary by Nicholas of Amsterdam 313
- 11.4 One of the representation systems mentioned by Paul of Venice in his *Summa philosophiae naturalis* 318
- 11.5 Reconstruction of the diagram Nifo has taken from the questions on *De latitudinibus formarum* by Blasius of Parma 320
- 11.6 The diagram as found in the 1486 edition of Blasius of Parma's questions on *De latitudinibus formarum* 322
- 13.1 Original diagram (and reconstruction) of a velocity increasing uniformly difformly in Angelo da Fossambruno's commentary on Heytesbury's *Regule solvendi sophismata* 367



## Notes on Contributors

### *Harald Berger*

is an Associate Professor at the University of Graz (Austria), Department of Philosophy. He teaches classic, medieval, and early modern philosophy. He specializes in late medieval philosophy, including manuscript studies and history of universities. Among his publications are the volumes: *Albert von Sachsen, Logik. Lateinisch—Deutsch* (Hamburg, 2010) and *Heinrich Totting von Oyta, Schriften zur Ars vetus* (Munich 2015) and a contribution on ‘Albert of Saxony on Parts and Wholes,’ in F. Amerini, I. Binini, M. Mugnai (eds.), *Mereology in Medieval Logic and Metaphysics* (Pisa 2019).

### *Joël Biard*

is Professor Emeritus at the University of Tours (France), Centre d’Études Supérieures de la Renaissance. His research fields are the late medieval philosophy of language, theories of mind and knowledge, and natural philosophy. Focussing on John Buridan and Blasius of Parma he has published, among several papers, *Science et nature. La théorie buridanienne du savoir*, (Paris 2012), *Les Questions sur l’âme de Jean Buridan* (Paris 2019) and, with Aurélien Robert, the collective volume *La philosophie de Blaise de Parme. Physique, psychologie, éthique* (Florence 2019). He is currently preparing a monograph about Blasius of Parma’s theory of matter.

### *Daniel A. Di Liscia*

is Lecturer at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München (Germany), at the Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy. He carried out several research projects on the Calculators’ tradition, especially on the geometrisation of natural philosophy and metaphysics. His most recent publications are ‘Biagio Pelacani da Parma’s Geometrisation of Latitudes and the Problems of the Mean Degree Theorem’ (in: J. Biard and A. Robert [eds.], *La philosophie de Blaise de Parme. Physique, psychologie, éthique* [Florence 2019]) and *Eine Wiener Expositio zum Tractatus de latitudinibus formarum. Edition mit Einführung und Kommentar* (Vienna, 2022). He is currently editing Jacques Legrand’s *Compendium utriusque philosophie*.

### *Elżbieta Jung*

is a historian of science, medieval philosophy and theology focusing on the mathematical physics of the Oxford Calculators. Additionally, she works on the history of late medieval universities and the history of feminism. She is Chair of

the Department of the History of Philosophy at the University of Łódź (Poland) and is Director of the Center for Philosophy of Nature. She is currently working on critical editions of Richard Kilvington's *Quaestiones super Physicam*, *Quaestiones super De generatione et corruptione* (with Robert Podkoński), and *Quaestiones super libros Sententiarum* (with Monika Michałowska). Her most recent publication (with R. Podkoński) is *Towards the Modern Theory of Motion. Oxford Calculators and the New Interpretation of Aristotle* (Łódź 2020).

*Edit Anna Lukács*

works at the Austrian Academy of Sciences at Vienna (Austria). She has been a Visiting Fellow at the Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies in Toronto (Canada) in 2018–2019. Her research focuses on the philosophy and theology of the Oxford Calculators, and their influence at the early University of Vienna. She has published numerous papers on Thomas Bradwardine and a Latin-German edition of selected parts from Thomas Bradwardine's *De causa Dei* (Göttingen 2013). Her latest book, *Dieu est une sphère* (Aix-en-Provence 2019) explores the theological uses of a geometric metaphor in the French Middle Ages.

*Richard J. Oosterhoff*

teaches early modern history at the University of Edinburgh (Scotland), with specialisms in intellectual history and history of science. Previously he held posts at the University of Cambridge, and fellowships at Houghton Library, the Huntington Library, and the Warburg Institute. His publications include *Making Mathematical Culture: University and Print in the Circle of Lefèvre d'Étaples* (Oxford 2018) and *Logodaedalus: Word Histories of Ingenuity in Early Modern Europe*, co-authored with Alexander Marr, Raphaële Garrod, and José Ramón Marcaida (Pittsburgh 2018).

*Robert Podkoński*

is a historian of natural philosophy at the Department of the History of Philosophy, University of Łódź (Poland). His research focuses on the Oxford Calculators' philosophical ideas and their impact on the development of early modern science. He has recently published editions of three treatises from Richard Swineshead's *Liber calculationum: De potentia rei*, *De luminosis*, and *De motu locali*, as well as an edition of two short treatises on motion ascribed to Richard Swineshead. He is currently preparing a critical edition of Richard Kilvington's commentary on Aristotle's *De generatione et corruptione* (with Elżbieta Jung).

*Stephen Read*

is Professor Emeritus of History and Philosophy of Logic at the University of St. Andrews (Scotland). He is the author of *Relevant Logic* (Oxford 1988) and *Thinking about Logic* (Oxford 1995), editor of *Sophisms in Medieval Logic and Grammar* (Dordrecht 1993), editor and translator of *Thomas Bradwardine: Insolubilia* (Leuven 2010), translator of *John Buridan: Treatise on Consequences* (New York 2015), and joint editor (with Catarina Dutilh Novaes) of *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Logic* (Cambridge 2016). In addition, he is the author of many articles on contemporary and medieval philosophy of logic and language. He led the Leverhulme-funded project 'Theories of Paradox in Fourteenth-Century Logic: Edition and Translation of Key Texts' (2017–2021).

*Sabine Rommevaux-Tani*

is researcher at the CNRS in France and current director of the laboratory SPHERE. Focusing on Radulphus Brito, Thomas Bradwardine, Nicole Oresme, Blasius of Parma, and Christopher Clavius, she has published extensively on the history of mathematics and natural philosophy in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance. She is the author of *Les nouvelles théories des rapports mathématiques du XIV<sup>e</sup> au XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle* (Paris 2014). She has recently published a critical edition of the anonymous treatise *De sex inconvenientibus* (Paris 2021).

*Fabio Seller*

is Research Fellow in the History of Medieval Philosophy at the University of Naples Federico II (Italy). He has widely published on late medieval and Renaissance philosophy and science, specifically on the history of astronomy and astrology. Among his publications are *Scientia astrorum. La fondazione epistemologica dell'astrologia in Pietro d'Abano* (Naples 2009), *La città, il sole, le stelle. Temi astrologici e astronomici in Tommaso Campanella* (Naples 2015), and *Apocalittica e tempo della fine in Tommaso Campanella* (Milan 2020).

*Edith D. Sylla*

is Professor Emerita at North Carolina State University (Raleigh, North Carolina, USA). She works on the history of mathematics, physics, and their interrelations from the late Middle Ages to the early eighteenth century. She published extensively on the different aspects related to the Calculators. Her most recent paper is 'Infinity and Continuity: Thomas Bradwardine and His Contemporaries,' in S. Shapiro and G. Hellman (eds.), *The History of Continua: Philosophical and Mathematical Perspectives* (Oxford 2021).

*Aníbal Szapiro*

is Assistant Professor of History of Science at the University of Buenos Aires (Argentina). After completing his Ph.D. in philosophy on the history of early modern Astronomy (*Changes in the Astronomical Concept of Horizon during Modernity*, 2016), his research has focused on the relation between optics and astronomy in late medieval and early modern thought. His contribution to the present volume was produced during his postdoc stay at the Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München (Germany) (2018–2019, DAAD Scholarship) on *The Calculators' Tradition and the Geometrisation of Light*.

*Mark Thakkar*

is a historian of fourteenth-century scholasticism. He took his D.Phil. in Philosophy at Balliol College, Oxford (2005–2010), and worked as a lexicographer on the *Dictionary of Medieval Latin from British Sources* (2010–2014) before embarking on an edition of John Wyclif's logical works, for which he held a Leverhulme Early Career Fellowship at the University of St. Andrews (2014–2018). He is currently an Honorary Research Fellow at St. Andrews and a Research Associate at the IRHT in Paris.

*Cecilia Trifogli*

is Professor of Medieval Philosophy at the University of Oxford (UK), and Chairperson of the British Academy committee responsible for the series *Auctores Britannici Medii Aevi*. She has published extensively on the tradition of Aristotle's natural philosophy in the Middle Ages. She is the author of a book on the early English tradition of commentaries on the *Physics* (*Oxford Physics in the Thirteenth Century*, 2000). She also works on critical editions of medieval philosophical texts. She has recently edited (with Silvia Donati and Jennifer Ashworth) the *Quaestiones* on the *Physics* by the Oxford master Geoffrey of Aspall (Oxford 2017).