

# Variation, Contact, and Reconstruction in the Ancient Indo-European Languages

# Brill's Studies in Historical Linguistics

*Series Editor*

Jóhanna Barðdal  
(Ghent University)

*Consulting Editor*

Spike Gildea  
(University of Oregon)

*Editorial Board*

Joan Bybee (*University of New Mexico*) – Lyle Campbell (*University of Hawai'i Mānoa*) – Nicholas Evans (*The Australian National University*)  
Bjarke Frellesvig (*University of Oxford*) – Mirjam Fried (*Czech Academy of Sciences*) – Russel Gray (*University of Auckland*) – Tom Güldemann (*Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin*) – Alice Harris (*University of Massachusetts*)  
Brian D. Joseph (*The Ohio State University*) – Ritsuko Kikusawa (*National Museum of Ethnology*) – Silvia Luraghi (*Università di Pavia*)  
Joseph Salmons (*University of Wisconsin*) – Søren Wichmann (*MPI/EVA*)

VOLUME 17

The titles published in this series are listed at [brill.com/bshl](http://brill.com/bshl)

# Variation, Contact, and Reconstruction in the Ancient Indo-European Languages

*Between Linguistics and Philology*

*Edited by*

Domenica Romagno  
Francesco Rovai  
Michele Bianconi  
Marta Capano



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Romagno, Domenica, 1977- editor. Title: Variation, contact, and reconstruction in the ancient Indo-European languages : between linguistics and philology / edited by Domenica Romagno [and 3 others].

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, [2022] | Series: Brill's studies in historical linguistics, 2211-4904 ; volume 17 | International conference proceedings. | Includes bibliographical references and index. | Summary: "The collected papers in this book address an array of important issues in the field of Historical Linguistics and, specifically, Indo-European Linguistics, including different theoretical approaches and innovative methodologies for studying language organization and change, building on the strict relationship between Linguistics and Philology. The papers provide significant contributions to the understanding of aspects of variation, contact and reconstruction, reflect a wide range of perspectives, and focus on issues and data from a large variety of languages. The themes that emerge from the papers center around two main research lines: 1. the relationship between language facts and historical accidents; 2. the relationship between grammatical categories and conceptual representations. The book is of interest for any reader seeking to gain insight into the nature of language organization and change"— Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022006625 (print) | LCCN 2022006626 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004508859 (hardback ; acid-free paper) | ISBN 9789004508873 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Indo-European languages—Congresses. | Languages in contact—Congresses.. | Language variation—Congresses.. | Reconstruction (Linguistics)—Congresses. | Extinct languages—Congresses. | LCGFT: Conference papers and proceedings.

Classification: LCC P901 .v37 2022 (print) | LCC P901 (ebook) | DDC 417/.7—dc23/eng/20220211

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022006625>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022006626>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: [brill.com/brill-typeface](http://brill.com/brill-typeface).

ISSN 2211-4904

ISBN 978-90-04-50885-9 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-50887-3 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Domenica Romagno and Francesco Rovai. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via [brill.com](http://brill.com) or [copyright.com](http://copyright.com).

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

To the loving memory of  
Romano Lazzeroni (1930–2020)





# Contents

Foreword	IX
List of Tables and Figures	XI
Abbreviations	XIII
Notes on Contributors	XV

## Understanding Language Organization and Change: The Key Role of Indo-European Studies. An Introduction

*Domenica Romagno and Francesco Rovai*

- 1 Variation, Contact and Reconstruction in the Indo-European Studies: Divergent Paths? 11  
*Maria Patrizia Bologna*

### PART 1

#### *Language Facts and Historical Accidents*

- 2 Textual Multilingualism in 2nd Millennium BC Anatolia as a Heuristic of a Culture: The State-of-the-Art 23  
*Paola Cotticelli Kurras*
- 3 Linguistic and Cultural Contacts in Roman Nijmegen: Insights From Theonyms and Non-Standard Variation in Latin Inscriptions 46  
*Francesca Cotugno*
- 4 Revising a Syntactic Isogloss: Nominal Modifiers Marking in Indo-European Languages 71  
*Artemij Keidan*
- 5 The Alphabetic Tradition of the *Conexiones* 109  
*Marco Mancini*
- 6 Greek, Syriac and Iranian Loanwords in Ancient Armenian: Reflexes of Voiceless Stops in Word-Initial Position 156  
*Andrea Scala*

## PART 2

***Grammatical Categories and Conceptual Representations***

- 7 Spatial Cognition and Frames of Reference in Indo-European 179  
*Annamaria Bartolotta*
- 8 Aspectual Distinctions under Direct Perception Predicates: The Interaction between Aspect and the Morphological Form of the Dependent Predicates 210  
*Davide Bertocci, Sira Rodeghiero and Emanuela Sanfelici*
- 9 Anticausativization in Latin and Early Italo-Romance: The Semantics of Predicates and the Syntax of Voice 243  
*Michela Cennamo*
- 10 Variation with Synonymous Suffixes between Derivation and Compounding in Ancient Greek 274  
*Francesco Dedè and Maria Margherita Cardella*
- 11 Aspects of the Verbal Domain in Greek and Latin: Changing Valency and Actionality 290  
*Domenica Romagno*
- Index of languages and language families 333
- Subject index 335

## Foreword and Acknowledgements

This volume is the first of two collections of selected papers from the Joint Colloquia on “Variation and Contact in the Ancient Indo-European languages: between Linguistics and Philology”, hosted by the University Pisa (Pisa, April 19–20, 2018) and the University of Oxford (Oxford, May 17–18, 2018). The goal of this joint venture was to provide a unique forum for scholars from different perspectives and research methods who are interested in the ancient Indo-European languages to come together to discuss their research on variation, contact and reconstruction and develop new directions and collaborations in the study of the principles underlying language organization and change. We are very grateful to all supporters, contributors, and especially participants for demonstrating the fundamental role that Historical Linguistics and Indo-European scholarship should and do play in the intellectual discourse and scientific debate.

Many people worked with enthusiasm and tireless work ethic to make this project a success. First and foremost, we wish to acknowledge our friend and colleague Giovanna Marotta, for the invaluable help and fundamental contribution: her guidance and wise suggestions were essential to the positive result of both the conference and the editorial process. As a distinguished member of the Scientific Committee, as a keynote speaker at the Oxford Conference and, most of all, as a constant point of reference for both of us, she is the *prima et praecipua movens* of this enterprise. We thank all other members of the Scientific and Organizing Committees: Michele Bianconi, Marta Capano, Kerstin Hoge, Elizabeth Tucker, and Andreas Willi. Heartfelt thanks go to the undergraduate and graduate students, and PhD students and Post-Docs, who helped plan every aspect of the Pisa Conference and worked tirelessly to solve any problems and to make participants feel welcome: Fabio Ardolino, Lorenzo Benedetti, Lucia Busso, Roberta Combei, Piero Cossu, Francesca Cotugno, Valeria De Rose, Valentina Elce, Giovanni Luigi Fabbri, Pietro Carlo Maria Gius-teri, Giulia Greco, Carolina Marescotti, Duccio Piccardi, Rosso Manuel Senesi, Andrea Sesoldi, Lucia Tamponi, Ottavia Tordini, Francesco Zuin.

The Pisa Conference was made possible by the generous support of the University of Pisa, the Department of Philology, Literature and Linguistics, and the PhD Programme in Philology, Literature and Linguistics of the same University. We wish to thank Claudia Martini, Roberta Ferrari and Marina Foschi, for participating at the opening ceremony, and especially for their welcome speeches. Thanks are also due to the administrative and clerical staff of the Department of Philology, Literature and Linguistics of the University of Pisa, whose

collaboration was fundamental to the success of the Conference: Andrea Ardinghi, Ivano Boschetti, Roberta Caponi, Daniela Carmassi, Antonietta Longo, and Annamaria Manetti.

We wish to extend heartfelt thanks to all the scholars who served both in the preliminary review process for the conferences and in the double blind peer-review for the present volume. We owe special thanks to Jóhanna Barðdal, for kindly hosting our volume in the prestigious Series of *Brill's Studies in Historical Linguistics* (BSHL): her advice was fundamental to this project. Our sincere gratitude also goes to Valeria De Rose, Giulia Greco, Carolina Marescotti and Edoardo Nardi, for the essential help and precious collaboration during all phases of the editorial process. We also thank Elisa Perotti and Jorik Groen for overseeing the publication.

Our deepest gratitude is dedicated to all Authors of the present volume for the outstanding contributions and the kind collaboration in each phase of the editorial process.

The editing of this volume is part of the PRIN Project on “Ancient languages and writing systems in contact: a touchstone for language change” (2017JBFP9H).

*Domenica Romagno and Francesco Rovai*

# Tables and Figures

## Tables

- 2.1 Correspondences between language used and text genre in Hittite literature 32
- 3.1 Distribution of texts on materials/objects from Nijmegen 50
- 3.2 Theonyms from Nijmegen 52
- 3.3 Non-classical forms in the Nijmegen corpus 59
- 3.4 Non-classical spellings concerning vocalism 60
- 3.5 Non-classical spellings concerning consonantism 60
- 3.6 Consonantism distributed according to the writing material 64
- 3.7 Non-classical spelling concerning vocalism (excluding non-local elements) 65
- 3.8 Non-classical spelling concerning consonantism (excluding non-local elements) 65
- 4.1 Summary of the parametrical values per language 96
- 4.2 Previous studies 97
- 5.1 Eusebius's and Jerome's 'packages' 120
- 5.2 Traditions A and B of the grammatonyms 145
- 5.3 Correspondences between grammatonyms and Hebrew words with allegorical/moralizing functions 148
- 6.1 Graphic correspondences of initial stops in Greek loans in Syriac and in Syriac loans in Armenian 158
- 6.2 Graphic correspondences of initial stops in Greek loans in Armenian 159
- 6.3 Phonetic correspondences of initial stops in Greek loans in Syriac and Syriac loans in Armenian 162
- 6.4 Phonetic correspondences of initial stops in Greek loans in Armenian 162
- 6.5 Greek loans with initial  $\psi$  and  $\xi$  in Armenian 166
- 6.6 Correspondences of the initial stops in Middle Iranian loans in Syriac 169
- 7.1 Front-behind terms in Vedic 185
- 7.2 Right-left terms in Vedic 185
- 7.3 Front-behind terms in Homeric Greek 186
- 7.4 Right-left terms in Homeric Greek 186
- 7.5 Sagittal front-behind terms in Vedic and Homeric Greek intrinsic FoRs 201
- 7.6 Lateral right-left terms in Vedic and Homeric Greek intrinsic FoRs 202
- 7.7 Front-behind-right-left terms in Vedic and Homeric Greek absolute FoRs 204

- 8.1 The morpho-syntactic encoding and the aspectual value of the perceived event in the three languages 219
- 8.2 The encoding of two kinds of direct perception in the three languages 237
- 11.1 Prototypical features of applicative and causative 322

## Figures

- 6.1 Structure of the linguistic repertoire: lay élites 157
- 6.2 Structure of the linguistic repertoire: religious élites 157
- 7.1 Intrinsic FoR (object-centered) 181
- 7.2 Intrinsic FoR (direct) 182
- 7.3 Relative FoR (egocentric) 183
- 7.4 Geographical map of ancient Ithaca. 195
- 7.5 Geographical map of Crete. Adapted from Gilboa et al. (2017: 563) 197
- 7.6 Trojan battlefield. Reproduced from Clay (2011: 104) 199

# Abbreviations

AE	<i>L'Année Épigraphique</i> (1888–; also included in <i>Revue Archéologique</i> ).
ChS	<i>Corpus der hurritischen sprachdenkmäler</i> (1984–), Multigrafica Editore, Roma.
CIL XIII	<i>Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum. Inscriptiones trium Galliarum et Germaniarum Latinae: Instrumentum domesticum</i> , (1901–1906), Berlin.
CLG/E	Saussure, Ferdinand De (1967–1974), CLG/E, <i>Cours de linguistique générale. Édition critique par Rudolf Engler</i> , Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden.
DLG	DeLamarre, X. (2003), <i>Dictionnaire de la langue gauloise: Une approche linguistique du vieux-celtique continental</i> , Éditions Errance, Paris.
EDHIL	Kloekhorst, Alwin (2008), <i>Etymological Dictionary of the Hittite Inherited Lexicon</i> , Brill, Leiden.
Finke	Finke, H. (1927), <i>Bericht der Römisch-Germanischen Kommission (BRGK)</i> 17.
HW <sup>2</sup>	Friedrich, Johannes & Kammenhuber, Annelies et al. (1975–1998), <i>Hethitisches Wörterbuch. Zweite, völlig neubearbeitete Auflage. Auf der Grundlage der edierten hethitischen Texte</i> , Vols. 1–5. Winter, Heidelberg.
Myth	Grimm, J. (1835), <i>Deutsche Mythologie</i> , Dietrich, Göttingen.
PIE	Proto-Indo-European
ŽHLBB IV	<i>Žamanakakic' Hayoc' lezvi bac'atrankan bařaran</i> , 4 vols., Haykakan SSH Gitowt'yownneri Akademaiyi hratarakč'owt'yown, Erevan.

## Glosses

1	first person
2	second person
3	third person
ABL	ablative (case)
ABL/INST	ablative-instrumental (in Khotanese)
ACC	accusative (case)
ACT	active
ADJ	adjectival declension (in Slavic)
AGR	agreement
CP	complementiser phrase
DAT	dative (case)
DP	determiner phrase
F	feminine

FUT	future
GEN	genitive (case)
GEN/DAT	genitive-dative (in Khotanese)
GER	gerundive
IMPER	imperative
IMPERS	impersonal
IMPF	imperfect (tense)
IND	indicative
INF	infinitive
INST	instrumental (case)
INTR	intransitive
LNK	pronominal linker and its outcomes
LOC	locative (case)
LRG	enlarged endings (in Khotanese and Middle Indian)
M	masculine
MPASS	medio-passive marker -R (in middle, passive or impersonal function)
N	neuter
NEG	negation
NOM	nominative (case)
NP	noun phrase
OBJ	object
PART	participle
PL	plural
PLUP	pluperfect (tense marker)
PP	past participle
PP	prepositional phrase
PRF	perfect (tense marker)
PRS	present (tense marker)
PST	past (tense marker)
PTC	particle
PTCP	participle
PV	preverb
RFL	reflexive
SBJV	subjunctive
SG	singular
STC	status constructus (in Syriac)
STE	status emphaticus (in Syriac)
STR	strong ending (in Germanic)
SUBJ	subject
TP	tense phrase

## Notes on Contributors

### *Annamaria Bartolotta*

Ph.D. 2000, University of Macerata, is Professor of Linguistics at the University of Palermo. Her research interests include cognitive linguistic analysis of spatio-temporal categories, grammaticalization (with reference to Homeric Greek and Old Latin), tense-aspect systems in ancient IE languages, typology of motion events, epistemic modality, spatial deixis, reconstruction of the Indo-European culture, typological classification of Aymara.

### *Davide Bertocci*

is Associate Professor of Linguistics at the Department of Linguistic and Literary Studies, University of Padua. His main research interest is historical linguistics, with a special focus on linguistic change in verbal morphology, and on the contribution of theoretical morphology. His studies deal with Latin, considered both at the synchronic level, and in comparison, with Italic, Ancient Greek and other Indo-European languages. As a member of the project “Grammatica del Veneto delle origini”, since 2018 he has been working on morphology and morpho-syntax of Medieval Venetan dialects.

### *Maria Patrizia Bologna*

was Assistant Professor at the University of Pisa and Associate Professor and, then, Professor at the University of Milan (now retired), where she taught Historical Linguistics and General Linguistics. Her main interests include various areas of the Indo-European studies, with a special focus on classical languages, and the history of linguistic thought.

### *Maria Margherita Cardella*

obtained her PhD in Historical Linguistics in 2018 from the University of Milan and the University of Rouen. Her research fields are Ancient Greek morphology and, in particular, nominal composition. She currently teaches Italian, History and Geography at the secondary school.

### *Michela Cennamo*

MPhil 1984, University of Manchester, is Professor of Historical and General Linguistics at the University of Naples “Federico II”. Her main research interests comprise argument structure and alignment, the semantics and syntax of voice, (in)transitivity, auxiliary selection, grammaticalization, with particular attention to the transition from Latin to Italo-Romance. Her research also cov-

ers valency, argument realization and the lexicon-syntax interface. Her recent publications include *Argument Realization and Change* (2012, a special issue of Transactions of the Philological Society, co-edited with Jóhanna Barðdal and Elly van Gelderen), *Argument Structure in Flux* (2013, Benjamins, co-edited with Jóhanna Barðdal and Elly van Gelderen), *Contrastive Studies in Verbal Valency* (Benjamins, 2017, co-edited with Lars Hellan and Andrej Malchukov), *Historical Syntax 2015* (Benjamins, 2020, co-edited with Claudia Fabrizio).

*Paola Cotticelli Kurras*

is Professor of Historical and Comparative Linguistics at the University of Verona. Since 2007, she is Director of the Department Research Centre for Studies in metalanguage and History of Ideas. She participated and directed many research programs in the field of the History of Ideas, Linguistic Concepts, and Grammarians (PRIN 2002–2004; 2011–2013; [2018–]2020–2022 as PI of a project of national relevance on the history of some syntactic categories in the Middle Ages). In 2007, she published *Lessico di Linguistica* (Edizioni dell'Orso, Alessandria). Other research fields: Hittitology, Historical Linguistics and Ancient languages, Graphematics. In 2014–2016, she was PI of a Grant by the Foundation von Thyssen (2014–2016) for a joint project on Indo-European Syntax (Winter Verlag, Heidelberg). In 2015–2017, she was Supervisor of a Marie Curie Grant (Horizon 2020; project SLUW, Fellow: Dr. Federico Giusfredi) on Luwian syntax, since 2021 she is supervisor of a Marie Curie Grant (Horizon 2020; project PaGHEMMo, fellow Dr. Filip De Decker). In 2002–2017, she was co-director of *Hethitisches Wörterbuch* (Winter Verlag, Heidelberg); since 2015, she is scientific director of the series “Laut-Schrift-Sprache / Script and Sound” (Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden), and “Texte der Hethiter” (Winter Verlag, Heidelberg). Since 2017: Coordination of a Master in ‘Teaching Italian as foreign/second language’. Since 2020 she is Coordinator of Cispels.

*Francesca Cotugno*

Ph.D. 2018, University of Pisa—University of Gent, is Post-doctoral Research Fellow at University of Verona within the project PRIN 2017 “Parts of speech meet rhetorics: Searching for syntax in the continuity between the Middle Ages and the Modern Age”. Her research interests focus on language contact and change, with a special attention to the Latinization of Britain and Celto-Germanic areas of the continent. She is currently working on Grammaticography and History of Linguistics, Historical Phonology and Morphology within the broader scenario of ancient Indo-European languages, together with Graphematics and the interactions between Linguistics and Paleography.

*Francesco Dedè*

is Associate Professor of Historical and Theoretical Linguistics at the University of Milan. His main research interests focus on morphology, from both a theoretical and historical point of view, with particular reference to ancient Indo-European languages. His research is also dedicated to aspects of linguistic categorization and to the history of Linguistics and linguistic thought.

*Artemij Keidan*

Ph.D. 2005, Sapienza University of Rome, is Associate Professor of General and Historical Linguistics at the same University. His research interests mainly focus on phonology and morphology, and include Pāṇini's texts and the history of the Indian indigenous grammatical tradition, ancient Indo-European languages (with a special attention to Sanskrit, Gothic and Slavic), the theoretical foundations of the comparative method.

*Marco Mancini*

(Rome, 1957) is Professor of Historical and General Linguistics at Sapienza University of Rome. He is ordinary member of the "Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei". His scholarly interests include problems of Indo-European and Semitic linguistic history, especially Iranian, Aramaic and Latin, graphemic issues, as well as themes concerning linguistic historiography.

*Sira Rodeghiero*

graduated in Classics and obtained her doctoral degree in Linguistics from the University of Padua with a thesis on the augment in Homeric Greek. She is currently a postdoctoral researcher at the University of Padua, working on the construction of a syntactically annotated corpus of Old Italian texts under the supervision of Professor Emanuela Sanfelici. She has been working on Greek and medieval Italian varieties, mainly from a diachronic perspective. She also contributed to the construction of syntactic and lemmatized corpora of Early Venetan (*GraVO*) and Franco-Italian texts (*RIALFrI*).

*Domenica Romagno*

Ph.D. 2004, Sapienza University of Rome, is Associate Professor of Linguistics at the University of Pisa. Her research interests include morphosyntax/semantics interface, linguistic categorization and change, verb systems and argument coding strategies in ancient (and modern) Indo-European languages, neural correlates of word classes, language processing in frontotemporal dementia.

*Francesco Rovai*

Ph.D. 2008, University of Pisa, is Associate Professor of Linguistics at the same university. His research interests include sociolinguistic variation and language change in Latin (with particular reference to phenomena of alignment variation and case syncretism), as well as aspects of multilingualism and language contact in the Ancient Mediterranean. He is currently working on the dialectics between orthography and paleography in Republican Latin.

*Emanuela Sanfelici*

is Associate Professor at the University of Padua. Her research interests lie in syntactic theory and language change. She has worked on relative clauses and non-finite complement clauses in various ancient and modern Indo-European languages from both a diachronic as well as an acquisitional perspective.

*Andrea Scala*

is Associate Professor of Linguistics at the State University of Milan, where he teaches Historical Linguistics, General Linguistics and Contact Linguistics. His research mainly focuses on Armenian language in its historical relations with neighboring languages, Romani lexicon and grammar, Italo-Romance dialects and historical jargons.