### Plutarch's Unexpected Silences

## **Brill's Plutarch Studies**

#### **Editors**

Lautaro Roig Lanzillotta (*University of Groningen*) Delfim F. Leão (*University of Coimbra*)

#### Editorial Board

Lucia Athanassaki
Mark Beck
Ewen L. Bowie
Timothy Duff
Rainer Hirsch-Luipold
Judith Mossman
Anastasios G. Nikolaidis
Christopher Pelling
Aurelio Pérez Jiménez
Luc van der Stockt
Frances B. Titchener
Paola Volpe Cacciatore

VOLUME 10

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/bps

# Plutarch's Unexpected Silences

## Suppression and Selection in the Lives and Moralia

Edited by

Jeffrey Beneker Craig Cooper Noreen Humble Frances B. Titchener



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Beneker, Jeffrey, editor.

 $\label{thm:polyanger} Title: Plutarch's \ unexpected \ silences: suppression \ and \ selection \ in \ the \ Lives \ and \ Moralia \ / \ edited \ by \ Jeffrey \ Beneker \ [and 3 others].$ 

Description: Leiden; Boston: Brill, [2022] | Series: Brill's Plutarch studies, 2451-8328; volume 10 | Chapters in this book all derive from papers delivered at a meeting of the Canadian and USA sections of the International Plutarch Society. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022001512 (print) | LCCN 2022001513 (ebook) |
ISBN 9789004514249 (hardback ; acid-free paper) | ISBN 9789004514256 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Plutarch. Lives-Congresses. | Plutarch. Moralia-Congresses. | Plutarch-Technique-Congresses. | Narration (Rhetoric)-Congresses. | Silence in literature-Congresses. | LCGFT: Literary criticism. | Conference papers and proceedings.

Classification: LCC PA4385 .P68 2022 (print) | LCC PA4385 (ebook) |
DDC 937.0099—dc23/eng/20220419
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022001512
LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022001513

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2451-8328 ISBN 978-90-04-51424-9 (hardback) ISBN 978-90-04-51425-6 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Jeffrey Beneker, Craig Cooper, Noreen Humble and Frances B. Titchener. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

To the memory of Rex Stem

••

#### **Contents**

#### Notes on Contributors IX

Introduction 1

Jeffrey Beneker, Craig Cooper, Noreen Humble and Frances B. Titchener

## PART 1 Silence and the Narrator

- 1 When Hermes Enters: Towards a Typology of the Silences of Plutarch's Narrator and Their Uses in Characterization 11 Eran Almagor
- 2 Plutarch's Narratorial Silences in the *Dion* 36 Michael Nerdahl
- 3 The Unspoken Bridge between Philosophy and Politics: Plutarch's *De genio Socratis* 50

  Bernard Boulet

# PART 2 Silence as a Literary Technique

- 4 The Quiet Life: Silence in Plutarch's *Demetrius* 65 *Thomas C. Rose*
- 5 Fine-Tuning Portraits in the *Lives*: Omissions that Clarify the Lessons in Leadership 81 Susan G. Jacobs
- 6 Plutarch's Silence about the Relationship between Military Success and Political Virtue in *Sulla* and *Caesar* 102

  \*\*Rex Stem†

VIII CONTENTS

7 The Repulsae of Aemilius Paulus in Plutarch's Aemilius 117 Colin Bailey

- 8 A Life in Pieces: Plutarch, *Crassus* 12.1–16.8 138 *James T. Chlup*
- 9 What about the Gold-Digging Ants? The Silences and Irony of Plutarch's De Herodoti malignitate 151 Charles W. Oughton

# PART 3 Silencing the Past and Present

- 10 Plutarch's Avoidance of Philip v 173 *Brad L. Cook*
- 11 Silence of the Lions: Exploring Plutarch's Omissions on Chaeronea 188

  Chandra Giroux
- 12 What Your Best Friend Won't Tell You: Thucydidean and Plutarchan Silences on Sicily 210 Christopher Pelling
- 13 Silencing Sparta 223
  Noreen Humble
- 14 The Peek-a-Boo Presence of Aeschines in Plutarch's *Demosthenes* 245

  Craig Cooper
- Plutarch on the Christians: Why So Silent? Ignorance, Indifference, or Indignity? 263
  Frederick E. Brenk
- 16 Plutarch's (Unexpected?) Silence on Jewish Monotheism 282 *Joseph Geiger*

General Index 295 Index Locorum 298

#### **Notes on Contributors**

#### Eran Almagor

is the author of studies on Plutarch and other Greek imperial-era writers (Strabo, Josephus). His interests include the history of the Achaemenid Empire and its image in Greek literature (especially in Herodotus and Ctesias), Plutarch's works (mainly the *Lives*), and the modern reception of antiquity (particularly in popular culture). He is the author of *Plutarch and the* Persica (Edinburgh University Press, 2018), and is co-editor of *Ancient Ethnography: New Approaches* (Bloomsbury, 2013) and *The Reception of Ancient Virtues and Vices in Modern Popular Culture* (Brill, 2017).

#### Colin Bailey

is Associate Professor of Classics at MacEwan University. He has published papers on Dio Chrysostom, Plutarch of Chaeronea, and Roman Republican history. He is co-editor (with A. Kemezis and B. Poletti) of *The Intellectual Climate of Cassius Dio: Greek and Roman Pasts* (Brill, 2022). His research interests focus on early imperial Greek literature and interactions between Greece and Rome.

#### Jeffrey Beneker

is Professor of Classics at the University of Wisconsin in Madison. His publications include *The Passionate Statesman: Eros and Politics in Plutarch's* Lives (Oxford, 2012), *The Rhetorical Exercises of Nikephoros Basilakes* (2016) and *The Byzantine Sindbad* (2021) for the Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library, and *Plutarch: How to Be a Leader* (Princeton, 2019). He is co-editor of *The Discourse of Marriage in the Greco-Roman World* (Wisconsin, 2020).

#### Bernard Boulet

is a retired professor of philosophy from Sainte-Foy College and from the Great Books program at Laval University, Quebec City. His main research interests are the comparison between ancient and modern political philosophy, and the relationships between philosophy, politics and religion. He is editor for Collection Résurgences and co-author of books on Plato, Machiavelli, and Descartes. He is co-founder of the Cercle du Savoir where he now teaches.

#### Frederick E. Brenk

is one of the founders of the International Plutarch Society. From 1982 to 2011 he taught at the Pontifical Biblical Institute, Rome, where he became professor ordinarius. He has published *In Mist Apparelled: Religious Themes in Plutarch's* 

Moralia and Lives (Brill, 1977), and with David E. Aune, *Greco-Roman Culture* and the New Testament (Brill, 2012). Lautaro Roig Lanzillotta and Delfim Leão (eds.), *Frederick E. Brenk on Plutarch, Religious Thinker and Biographer* (Brill, 2017) recently appeared. Forthcoming is *Plutarch on Literature, Religion, and Life* (Brill, 2022).

#### James T. Chlup

is Associate Professor of ancient history at the University of Manitoba. He is the co-editor (with Conor Whately) of *Greek and Roman Military Manuals: Genre and History* (2020) and the author of articles and chapters on Livy, Plutarch, Onasander, Caesar and Frontinus. His major project is a commentary on Plutarch's *Crassus*.

#### Brad L. Cook

is Associate Professor of Classics at the University of Mississippi. He writes variously on ancient biographical traditions, e.g., "The Essential Philip" (*GRBS*, 2005), "A Watery Folktale in the *Alexander Romance*" (*SyllClass*, 2009), and "Petrarch's Reading of Cicero's Letters" (*C&M*, 2012), with ongoing focus on Demosthenes, e.g., "Athenian Terms of Civic Praise in the 330s B.C." (*GRBS*, 2009), "Swift-boating in Antiquity" (*Rhetorica*, 2012), "'He's a Scythian!' The 'Birther' Attack in Classical Athens" (forthcoming), and a chapter in *The Oxford Handbook of Demosthenes* (2019) on the ancient and Byzantine biographies of Demosthenes, about which a book-length study is nearing completion.

#### Craig Cooper

is Professor of Classics in the Department of History at the University of Lethbridge, where he previously served as Dean of Arts and Science. His research and teaching focus on Greek History, Athenian Law, Greek Oratory and Rhetoric, Ancient Biography and Plutarch. His works include *Epigraphy and the Greek Historian* (2008); "Making irrational myth plausible history: Polybian intertextuality in Plutarch's *Theseus*" (2007); "Aristoxenus,  $\Pi$ ερὶ Bίων and Peripatetic Biography" (2002), and his 2001 translation of Hyperides in *The Oratory of Classical Greece: Vol. v: Dinarchus, Hyperides, Lycurgus*. He is currently working on translation and commentary of Demosthenes 36, 45, 46.

#### Joseph Geiger

is Shalom Horowitz Professor of Classics Emeritus at The Hebrew University of Jerusalem. He is the author of over one hundred learned articles, ranging from historiography and biography to intellectual history, with forays into Talmudic studies and classical topics in art and literature. His books include *Cornelius* 

ΧI

Nepos and Ancient Political Biography (1985), Masada II: The Latin and Greek Documents (with H.M. Cotton, 1989), The First Hall of Fame: A Study of the Statues of the Forum Augustum (2008), and Hellenism in the East: Studies on Greek Intellectuals in Palestine (2013). He has been a Visiting Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Oxford, and a Visiting Professor at Heidelberg and Yale.

#### Chandra Giroux

completed her PhD at McGill under the supervision of Hans Beck and Darian Totten in 2021 on *Plutarch's Chaironeia: The Local Horizon of World Empire*. She also holds an MA in Classical Studies from the University of Ottawa and an MA in Greek and Roman Archaeology from Newcastle University. She is the editor of *Plutarch: Cultural Practice in a Connected World* (Teiresias Supplements Online forthcoming), which explores the theme of Plutarch and his representation of local worlds in relation to the Roman Empire through the lens of culture.

#### Noreen Humble

is Professor of Classics at the University of Calgary and Associate Director of the Calgary Institute for the Humanities. Her research centers on Xenophon and Plutarch, both in their contemporary setting and in the early modern period. She is the author of *Xenophon of Athens: A Socratic on Sparta* (Cambridge, 2021), the editor of *Plutarch's Lives: Parallelism and Purpose* (Classical Press of Wales, 2010), and the co-editor (with Pat Crowley and Silvia Ross) of *Mediterranean Travels* (Legenda, 2011).

#### Susan G. Jacobs

is an independent scholar who focuses on Plutarch's *Parallel Lives* and the guidance they provide to leaders. She began to study Plutarch after completing a doctorate in Economics at Duke University and spending 20 years in forecasting and strategic planning. Drawing on this background, she examined Plutarch's deterrent *Lives* in her doctoral thesis in Classics at Columbia University and subsequently expanded this analysis in *Plutarch's Pragmatic Biographies: Lessons for Statesmen and Generals* (Brill, 2017). Her current project, *Plutarch's Supporting Cast in the Lives*, explores the characterization and roles of major figures who are not the subject of a biography.

#### Michael Nerdahl

is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Classics at Bowdoin College. In addition to publishing several essays on Plutarch's *Lives* that examine the relationship between the biographer's narrative strategies and his moralism, he

is an avid designer and promoter of games in the college classroom, creating student-centered, role-immersion experiences with settings like the Trojan War, the Senate of the mid-Republic, and the court of Nero.

#### Charles W. Oughton

is Assistant Professor in Classical Studies at Brigham Young University. His research focuses on ancient historiography and biography, with emphases on the response to the Greek historiographic tradition in Rome and the modern reception of the ancient historians. He has won several teaching awards, including an award from the Texas Language Center as the Best Foreign Language Instructor at UT-Austin, and has recently had two of his students win the Phinney Prize as the top performing Beginning Greek students on the College Greek Exam.

#### Christopher Pelling

is Emeritus Regius Professor of Greek at Oxford University. His books include Literary Texts and the Greek Historian (2000), Plutarch and History (2002), Twelve Voices from Greece and Rome: Ancient Ideas for Modern Times (with Maria Wyke, 2014), Herodotus and the Question Why (2019), and commentaries on Plutarch's Antony (1988) and Caesar (2011), Herodotus 6 (with Simon Hornblower, 2017), and Thucydides 6 and 7 (2022). He is now working on a further commentary on Plutarch's Alexander.

#### Thomas C. Rose

is Assistant Professor of Classics at Randolph-Macon College. His recent work includes articles on kingship, ruler-cult, and military technology in the early Hellenistic period. He is currently completing a commentary on Plutarch's *Demetrius*.

#### Rex Stem

was Associate Professor of Classics at the University of California, Davis. He was educated at Harvard (BA, 1991), University College, Oxford (MSt, 1992) and Michigan (PhD, 1999). His publications include *The Political Biographies of Cornelius Nepos* (Michigan, 2012), a new edition of Francis Kelsey's *Julius Caesar: Commentaries on the Gallic War* (Michigan Classical Press, 2017), and numerous articles on Roman biography, historiography, oratory, and political thought. He served as chair of the program in Classics at Davis, where he was widely recognized as an outstanding teacher and mentor to many students. Rex passed away on October 21, 2020.

XIII

#### Frances B. Titchener

is Distinguished Professor of Classics and History and Director of the Classics Program at Utah State University where she has taught since 1987. She has been a Fulbright Research Fellow in Leuven, Belgium (2003), as well as spent a term in residence there as a visitor (2010). She was a Visiting Scholar at the University of Crete in Rethymno (2017) and is Secretary of the International Plutarch Society as well as co-editor of the journal *Ploutarchos*. She is also the co-editor of numerous volumes on Plutarch or Plutarch scholars, including the forthcoming *Cambridge Companion to Plutarch*.

via free access