Islamic Architecture through Western Eyes

Michael Greenhalgh - 9789004524859 Downloaded from Brill.com 03/01/2024 09:13:58AM via free access

# Islamic Architecture through Western Eyes

Volume 1 Spain, Turkey, India and Persia

By

Michael Greenhalgh



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Agra, Uttar Pradesh, India: the Chini Ka Rauza, or Tomb of Afzai Khan Shirazi, Prime Minister to Shah Jahan. Built 1635, and seen here in a print of 1844 by William Henry Sleeman, a British administrator; at that date, a lieutenant-colonel in the Bengal Army, and later a major-general.

The complete endnotes are available at https://doi.org/10.6084/10.6084/m9.figshare.21229334.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at https://catalog.loc.gov LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022947601

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISBN 978-90-04-52484-2 (hardback, vol. 1) ISBN 978-90-04-54086-6 (hardback, vol. 2) ISBN 978-90-04-54088-0 (hardback, vol. 3) ISBN 978-90-04-54107-8 (hardback, set) ISBN 978-90-04-52485-9 (e-book, vol. 1) ISBN 978-90-04-54087-3 (e-book, vol. 2) ISBN 978-90-04-54089-7 (e-book, vol. 3)

Copyright 2023 by Michael Greenhalgh. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands. Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau, V&R unipress and Wageningen Academic. Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

# Contents

## Preface for the Three Volumes IX List of Illustrations XI

## 1 Introduction 1

- 1 Overview 1
- 2 Crusades in East and West 4
- 3 Contacts through Trade Trigger Westernised Modernisation 5
- 4 Constantinople 7
- 5 Arrangement of the Book 7

### 2 Churches, Mosques and Travellers 9

- 1 Westerners Travel around the East 9
  - 1.1 Maps and Street Plans 11
- 2 Ambassadors Study the Empire 15
  - 2.1 Prosperity 17
  - 2.2 Amenability 18
  - 2.3 Survivability 18
- 3 Viewing Mosque Architecture 19
  - 3.1 Mosques, Churches and Antiquities: The Diet of Greece and Rome 21
- 4 Drawing Mosque Exteriors and Interiors 26
- 5 A Conflicting Mix of Ideas and Beliefs 29
- 6 Forgotten? Westerners and the Eastern Crusades 30
- 7 Dress and Doctors 32
- 8 Western Habits and Actions Offend Muslims: Footwear and Spitting 33
- 9 The End of Islam? The Empire in Decline? 36
  - 9.1 Disparities between West and East 39
  - 9.2 Dilapidated Buildings and Imperial Decline 40
- 10 The Various Inhabitants of the Empire 42
- 11 Architecture in the Empire: Wood, Maintenance and Competence 44
  - 11.1 Wooden Houses 44
  - 11.2 Maintenance of Mosques and Other Foundations 46
  - 11.3 The Turks as Builders 47
- 12 Advice to Western Travellers from Western Authors 49 12.1 *The Costs of Travel* 49
- 13 East Is East: The Development of Curiosity Travel 50
  - 13.1 Writing Travel Books 53
  - 13.2 The Illustrated Book 56

- 3 Spain 60
  - 1 Christians versus Muslims 60
  - 2 The Alhambra, Granada (Reconquered 1492) 61
  - 3 Charles v and Architecture 66
  - 4 Córdoba: the Great Mosque (Mezquita) 69
    - 4.1 Adverse Criticisms of the Mezquita 73
      - 4.2 Madinat al-Zahra Near Córdoba 76
  - 5 Seville (Recaptured in 1248) 76
  - 6 Girault de Prangey and Arab Architecture 77

#### 4 Constantinople and Adrianople with a Note on Greece 84

- 1 The Imperial Firman 84
- 2 The Ottoman Building Programme 89
- 3 Collecting Manuscripts in Constantinople 91
- 4 Adrianople 93
  - 4.1 Üç Şerefeli Mosque 94
  - 4.2 Selimiye Mosque 95
  - 4.3 The Beyazidiye 99
- 5 Constantinople 99
- 6 Cityscape: "'Tis Distance Lends Enchantment to the View" 100
  - 6.1 Domes and Minarets 103
  - 6.2 Other Points of View 105
- 7 Cityscape: Strolling the Streets 108
  - 7.1 An Overview of Mosques 109
  - 7.2 Mosques and Cleanliness 113
- 8 Seeing Hagia Sophias Everywhere They Look: Royal Mosques 115
  - 8.1 The Beyazide/Bajazet 119
  - 8.2 Hagia Sophia 120
  - 8.3 Sixteenth and Seventeenth Century Descriptions 122
  - 8.4 Eighteenth Century Descriptions 125
  - 8.5 Nineteenth Century Descriptions 126
  - 8.6 Nineteenth Century Criticisms and Spolia 129
  - 8.7 Slippers and Bad Behaviour 134
  - 8.8 Mosaics 136
  - 8.9 Later Nineteenth Century Opinions 141
- 9 Domes, Minarets, and Dimensions 143
  - 9.1 Domes and Their History in the West 145
  - 9.2 A Note on Christopher Wren 148
  - 9.3 Domes and Their History in the East 149
  - 9.4 The Dome of Hagia Sophia 152
- Some Constantinople Mosques Visited by Travellers 155
  10.1 Kuchuk H. Sophia 155

- 10.2 Sultan Achmet (1609–1616) 156
- 10.3 Süleymaniye (1550–57) 162
- 10.4 Early Accounts 162
- 10.5 The Nineteenth Century 163
- 10.6 Hagia Sophia as the Model for the Süleymaniye 165
- 10.7 Marble and Porphyry Spolia 167
- 10.8 Yeni Cami, the New Mosque of the Valide Sultan (1597ff, Completed Only in 1665) 170
- 10.9 Scutari: Mosque of Sultan Sélim III 171
- 10.10 Eyup Too Sacred for Christians 172
- 11 Topkapi / Seraglio 174
- 12 Greece: Athens 177
- 13 Tripolitza 179

#### 5 Asia Minor 188

- 1 On and Off the Beaten Track 188
- 2 Aleppo 190
- 3 Alexandria Troas 194
- 4 Ankara 195
- 5 Ayasoluk Selçuk Ephesus 196
  - 5.1 Identifying the Sites 196
  - 5.2 Isa Bey Mosque and Church of Saint John 197
- 6 Bursa 202
- 7 Cyzicus 205
- 8 The Dardanelles and Its Cannon 206
- 9 Erzerum 207
- 10 Karaman, Mut and Nigde 209
- 11 Konya 211
  - 11.1 Tiles and Travellers 214
- 12 Lampsacus 216
- 13 Magnesia / Manisa 216
- 14 Miletus 219
- 15 Mylasa 220
- 16 Nicaea 220
- 17 Pergamum 222
- 18 Smyrna 223

#### 6 India and Persia 227

- 1 India 227
  - 1.1 Agra 228
  - 1.2 Ahmadabad 234
  - 1.3 Aurangabad 235

1.4 Bijapur 236 1.5 Delhi 238 1.6 Fatehpur Sikri 241 1.7 Golconda 242 1.8 Sikandra 243 2 Persia 244 **Collecting Persian Tiles** 3 3.1 Ardebil 249 3.2 Erivan 251 3.3 Isfahan 252 3.4 Kashan 258 3.5 Mashhad 259 3.6 Nakhchivan 262 3.7 Persepolis 263 3.8 Qazvin 263 3.9 Qom 264 3.10 Samarra 266 3.11 Semnan 267 3.12 Shiraz 268 3.13 Soltaniyeh 270 3.14 Tabriz 276 3.15 Teheran 283 A Miscellany of Mosques 284 4 4.1 Ahar 284 4.2 Ani 284 4.3 Baku 284 4.4 Benares 285 4.5 Diarbekir 285 4.6 Ghazni 285 4.7 Karbala 286 4.8 Kirkuk 287 4.9 Merv 287 4.10 Varamin 288

247

7 Coda: Mecca and Medina 293

Bibliography – Sources 297 Bibliography – Modern Scholars 332 Index 338 Illustrations 345

# Preface for the Three Volumes

*Islamic Architecture through Western Eyes* offers a commented anthology of western descriptions of Islamic buildings, with the accounts for each structure arranged in chronological order. The majority are from the seventeenth century through the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries as travel from the West became easier, more popular, and cheaper, thanks to viable roads and then steamships and railways. The anthology ends about the time of the First World War, which changed forever most of the countries it covers.

The anthology will appear in three volumes, each volume independent of the other two, and each with its own complete bibliography. Each will offer often lengthy accounts of the studied buildings, referenced in the printed book as brief notes (author, date, page) at the end of each chapter, and in full https:// doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.21229334. [#Exact URLs for successive volumes to be added later]. These source notes will total up to some three hundred thousand words for each volume. There follows a tasting list of the contents of each volume.

Volume 1: Spain, Turkey, India and Persia, the book you are now reading, examines the more northern latitudes, beginning with Iberia, Islamic for some eight hundred years from the Umayyad Conquest of 711. In Córdoba, conquered by Ferdinand 11 of Castile in 1236, the Mezquita immediately became a church. The whole peninsula became Christian after the fall of the Nasrid Kingdom of Granada in 1492, when the Alhambra at Granada became the Court of Ferdinand and Isabella. We shall examine why, apart from these stars, so few Islamic buildings survive throughout the peninsula. Our attention then moves to Constantinople, as did that of western states who sent ambassadors to the Ottoman Empire (settled there in 1453), where they are the source of much information on that city's buildings. A note on Greece, in Ottoman hands until 1829, helps clarify how the Ottomans dealt with the antique, especially its marble, as do a multitude of accounts of travel into the large expanses of Asia Minor. The volume ends with a brief survey from Arabia to Persia and British India, offering accounts by traders, politicians, and diplomats, many of whom journeyed through Turkey to get there. Each of these countries deserves its own volume, and perhaps the notes here will inspire full accounts.

*Volume 2: Syria, Egypt and North Africa* will examine southerly latitudes, namely the Mediterranean from Syria and the Holy Land, Lebanon, Egypt, Algeria, Tunisia, and Morocco. Jerusalem, much visited by pilgrims of three faiths, made its money from shepherding them (often with entrance fees) through what were now Muslim, not Christian buildings; Jews could face charges to pray at the Temple Wall, Christians to baptise in the Jordan. Damascus attracted attention for its Umayyad Mosque, which could have been as difficult to access as the late seventh century Dome of the Rock itself. Easier to visit were the mosques and tombs of Cairo, which boasts the finest collection of Islamic architecture anywhere in the world. Selim I conquered the Mamluk Sultanate in 1517, signalling the end of Cairo's years of architectural glory. This is because the heavy Ottoman hand eventually nurtured a version of modernity for which trade imports and finance, both from the West, were the main motors. In North Africa, mosques were (and remain) forbidden to non-Muslims (except for Algeria and Tunisia when they were under French control), and hence our travellers had to resort to third party accounts. Morocco was to remain independent, its architecture safe from foreign hands. Not so in Algeria or (later) Tunisia where, although many monuments survived and indeed were assiduously restored (as in Cairo), French hegemony – westernised modernisation again – destroyed many Islamic buildings and town layouts.

Volume 3: Palaces around the Mediterranean studies only civil architecture. We know of many early and prestigious palace complexes (Samarra, Konya), but have no descriptions until Topkapi Sarayi in Constantinople was visited by ambassadors and their secretaries, who reckoned assessing imperial strength in part by what they saw there. Palaces proliferated (with a veritable rash of them in Constantinople) because, in contradistinction to the attitude in the West, where some survived for centuries (Louvre, Buckingham Palace, Karlsruhe) Islamic rulers were generally averse to the continuing occupation of earlier structures. Hence, most of the palaces we deal with in this volume are late constructions, dating from the seventeenth to the nineteenth centuries, all rich in fittings and ornaments if not (to western eyes) in architectural form. In Damascus, some sumptuous eighteenth and nineteenth century palaces were much visited and described at length, perhaps as compensation for the difficulties of entering the Umayyad Mosque. Remembering Ibn Khaldun's fourteenth century description of how such contents were moved around and their original structures were left to rot, we can understand why few earlier palaces have survived into our century. Travellers' descriptions often allow us to assess the impact of western trade, taste, and imports on their decoration and fitments, and to examine the encroachment of westernised modernism, responsible according to many commentators for the degradation of Islamic styles.



The full endnotes can be accessed via this QR code and the following dynamic link: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.21229334.

# Illustrations

- 1 Boullaye le Gouz in Levantine dress 1653 347
- 2 William Lithgow in "Turkish" dress 1611–12 347
- 3 Ali Bey self portrait 1816 347
- 4 John Ireland in Arab dress, travelling 1851–56 348
- 5 Thomas Cook: A cruise dragoman 348
- 6 Thomas Cook: Palestine encampment in 1903 348
- 7 Owen Jones: Granada, Alhambra, section 1842 349
- 8 Owen Jones: Granada, Alhambra, Plan of complete hill 1842 349
- 9 Owen Jones: Granada, Alhambra, Patio de la Aberca 1842 349
- 10 James Murphy: Granada, Alhambra, Hall of the Two Sisters 1813 349
- 11 Owen Jones: Granada, Alhambra, a capital and decoration 1842 349
- 12 Philibert-Joseph Girault de Prangey: Córdoba, Mezquita, Villa Viciosa Chapel 1841 350
- 13 James Murphy: Córdoba: Mezquita 1813 350
- 14 Ricardo Velazquez Bosco: Aqueduct to Medinet al Zahra 1912 350
- 15 Philibert-Joseph Girault de Prangey: Palermo, Zisa 1841 351
- 16 Philibert-Joseph Girault de Prangey: Palma da Majorca, Arab baths 1841–2 351
- 17 Antoine Melling: Constantinople, panorama 1819 352
- 18 Guillaume-Joseph Grelot: Constantinople, S Sophia exterior 1680 352
- 19 Guillaume-Joseph Grelot Constantinople, S Sophia interior 1680 352
- 20 Guillaume-Joseph Grelot Constantinople, S Sophia interior 1680 352
- 21 Guillaume-Joseph Grelot: How Muslims pray 1680 352
- 22 Guillaume-Joseph Grelot: Constantinople, Sultan Achmet Mosque 1680 353
- 23 Thomas Knox: Constantinople, dervishes 1879 353
- 24 Thomas Knox: Constantinople, dogs 1879 353
- 25 James Dallaway: Table of church and mosque dimensions 1799 354
- 26 Giuseppe Rosaccio: Constantinople, plan 1598 354
- 27 Simon Pinargenti: Constantinople, plan 1573 354
- 28 Pieter Coecke van Aelst: Constantinople, Hippodrome 1533 355
- 29 Jean Baptiste Marchebeus: Constantinople, Hippodrome 1839 355
- 30 William Hogarth: Constantinople, Hippodrome by 1723–24 355
- 31 Karl Otto Hartmann: Konya, Sahib Atta Mosque, photograph 1910 356
- 33 Gertrude Bell: Konya city wall, photograph 1900 356
- 34 Charles Texier: Konya, city gate 1849 356
- 35 Charles Texier: Konya, Palace ruins 1849 356
- 36 Konya: Ince Minare Minaret, modern photograph 357
- 37 Konya: Palace tiles, now Karatay Medrese Ceramic Museum 357

ILLUSTRATIONS

- Konya: Palace tiles, now Karatay Medrese Ceramic Museum Edward Falkener: Ayasoluk/Ephesus, Sultan Selim Mosque 1862 Ayasoluk/Ephesus, Sultan Selim Mosque, modern photograph Ayasoluk/Ephesus, Sultan Selim Mosque, 19thC photograph Edward Falkener: Ayasoluk/Ephesus, Sultan Selim Mosque, interior 1862 Charles Texier: Ayasoluk/Ephesus, Sultan Selim Mosque, 1862 Charles Texier: Ankara, Temple of Augustus 1839 Joseph Pitton de Tournefort: Ankara, view from a distance 1718 Pierre Trémaux: Miletus, Ilyas Bey Mosque, 1858 photograph Charles Texier: Erzerum, city view with imaret gateway 1842 Charles Texier: Bursa, the Green Mosque 1839 Ahmed Djemal Pasha: Aleppo, citadel with palace remains 1918 Peter Mundy: Sikandra, Akbar's Mausoleum 1632 361 William Henry Sleeman: Sikandra, Interior of Akbar's Mausoleum 1844-James Fergusson: Agra, Mausoleum of Itimad ud Dowla 1869 William Henry Sleeman: Delhi, Qutub Minar 1844 Le Tour du Monde: Fatehpur Sikri, the mosque, print after a photograph 1872 John B. Ireland: Bijapur, the Gol Gumbaz (Tomb of Mohammed Shah) 1859 William Henry Sleeman: Agra, China Tomb, "now in ruins," 1844 James Fergusson & Major Gill: Aurungabad, stereo photos 1864 Ida Pfeiffer: Agra, Taj Mahal 1851 Agra: Taj Mahal, modern photograph James Fergusson: Bijapur, Jumma Masjid 1876 James Fergusson: Bijapur, Gol Gumbaz, 1866 photograph James Fergusson: Bijapur, Roza complex, 1866 photograph Charles Texier: Tabriz, Blue Mosque, section 1842 Friedrich Sarre: Tabriz, Blue Mosque, 1901 photograph 365 Charles Texier: Sultanieh, view of the mosque/mausoleum 1842 Charles Texier: Sultanieh, section of the mosque/mausoleum 1842 Charles Texier: Tabriz, Blue Mosque, gateway 1842 Jules Laurens: Tabriz, Blue Mosque, gateway, painting 1846–48 James Baillie Fraser: Mashad, Imam Riza Mausoleum 1834 Friedrich Sarre: Samarcand, tiles from unnamed monument in his collection 1901 Friedrich Sarre: Mashad, tile from Imam Riza Mausoleum in his collection 1901 Sir Robert Ker Porter: Ispahan, panorama of the Meidan 1821
- 73 André Daulier-Deslandes: Ispahan, Meidan 1673 368

- 74 Charles Texier: Ispahan, section of the mosque 1842 368
- 75 L'Illustration, Journal Universel: Ispahan in the popular press 1846–7 369
- 76 James Fergusson: Ghazni, minaret 1876 370
- Godfrey Vigne: Kabul, the mosque at Babar's tomb 1840 370
- 78 James Morier: Ardebil, mosque 1818 370
- 79 Sir Robert Ker Porter: Nazirabad, caravanserai 1821 371
- 80 William Macmichael: Hafsa Sultan, caravanserai 1819 371
- 81 Philibert-Joseph Girault de Prangey: Rome from Trajan's Column, photograph, late 1840s? 372
- 82 Anonymous: Constantinople, panorama, later 19th century photograph 372
- 83 Germain Bapst: Construction of a panorama building, photograph 1891 372
- 84 Istanbul Historical Museum: Conquest of Constantinople, panorama 372
- 85 Thomas Allom: Poster advertising his panorama 1850 373
- 86 Jacob Spon: Athens, view 1674 374
- 87 Jean Le Tavernier: Siege of Constantinople in BnF мs Fr 9087 374
- 88 William Wrighte: Design for a folly 1790 374
- 89 Francis Hervé: Constantinople, street view 1837 375
- 90 Thomas Allom: Constantinople, street view 1839 375
- 91 Jaspar Isaac: Constantinople as he imagined it 1583–1624 375
- 92 Carsten Niebuhr: View of Mecca, Great Mosque 1773 376
- 93 Carsten Niebuhr: View of Medina, Great Mosque 1773 376
- 94 Mecca: Great Mosque Courtyard, modern photograph 376
- Jean Le Tavernier: Bertrand de la Broquière (in the East 1432–33) offers a
  Koran to Duke Philip of Burgundy in BnF Ms Fr 9087 376