

Architecture of Anxiety

Arts and Archaeology of the Islamic World

Edited by

Margaret Graves (*Brown University*)

Marcus Milwright (*University of Victoria*)

Mariam Rosser-Owen (*Victoria and Albert Museum*)

VOLUME 20

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/aaIW

Architecture of Anxiety

Body Politics and the Formation of Islamic Architecture

By

Heba Mostafa



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Dome of the Rock in the Mosque of Omar, Jerusalem. Chromolithograph by H. Clerget and J. Gaildrau after François Edmond Pâris, 1862, Souvenirs de Jérusalem, held in the Wellcome Collection.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Mostafa, Heba, author.

Title: Architecture of anxiety : body politics and the formation of Islamic architecture / by Heba Mostafa.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, [2024] | Series: Arts and archaeology of the Islamic world, 2213-3844 ; volume 20 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023054640 (print) | LCCN 2023054641 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004677777 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004690189 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Islam and architecture. | Architecture—Psychological aspects. | Islamic architecture—Political aspects. | Islamic architecture—Historiography.

Classification: LCC NA2543.174 M68 2024 (print) | LCC NA2543.174 (ebook) | DDC 720.88/297—dc23/ENG/20231206

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023054640>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023054641>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2213-3844

ISBN 978-90-04-67777-7 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-69018-9 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004690189

Copyright 2024 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

For my parents



Contents

Acknowledgements	IX
List of Figures and Plates	XII
Note on Transliteration	XV
Plates	XVI

1 Introduction	1
1 An Architecture of Anxiety	1
2 Body Politics and Chimeric Caliphs	7
3 Histories of the Formation of Islamic Architecture	10
4 Book Structure	15
2 The Caliph's Multivalent Body	
<i>The Minbar and Seat of Rule</i>	17
1 The Caliph's Multivalent Body	17
2 Muhammad in the Mosque: The Minbar and Throne	18
3 In the Shadow of Muhammad's Minbar	24
4 The <i>Kursī</i> and <i>Sarīr</i>	29
3 Death of a Caliph	
<i>Modalities of Existential Safety at the Mosque and Dar al-Imara</i>	35
1 Death of a Caliph	35
2 Authority, Public Audience, and Sanctuaries in Early Islam	36
3 The Maqsura	38
4 The Mosque and Dar al-Imara in Early Islam	41
4 United under the Dome of Heaven	50
1 The Qubbat al-Khadra' and Civil Strife in Early Islam	50
2 Retrieving the Lost History of an Islamic Heavenly Dome	53
3 What is this Khadra'?	61
4 Fit for a Caliph: The Khadra' of Mu'awiya	70
5 Sedition Is Worse Than Murder	
<i>The Mosque and Dar al-Imara in Iraq</i>	73
1 Ziyad in Iraq	73
2 Portrait of a Caliphal Protégé	75
3 Early Islamic Urbanism in Iraq	79
4 The Mosque and Dar al-Imara in Iraq	82
5 The Mosque and Dar al-Imara in Iraq Reconsidered	90
6 Existential Anxiety, Temporality, and the End of Days in Islamic Jerusalem	95
1 Jerusalem under the Umayyads	95
2 The Appointed Time and the Divine Encounter	97

3	The Dome of the Rock in the Shadow of God's Celestial Court	101
4	Ritual Practice and Embodied Sanctity at the Dome of the Rock	109
5	Architecture for an Otherworld	113
7	Epilogue	121
1	Architecture of Anxiety Redux	121
2	Body Politics and the Formation of Islamic Architecture	129
	Bibliography	133
	Index	149

Acknowledgements

This book would not have been possible without the support of advisors, mentors, friends, family, as well as multiple institutions and funding bodies. These acknowledgements can never do justice to how I have been lifted by every person and institution named and unnamed. I wish to thank my academic advisors without whom none of this would have been possible. I owe immense gratitude to my thesis supervisor at the Department of Architecture at Cambridge University, Wendy Pullan, for her expansive vision that laid the foundation for this work. She inspired, nurtured, and led by example. I could not have wished for a better guide. A special thanks to my advisor and mentor Bernard O'Kane, with whom I began my academic journey and who remained a steadfast guide and inspiration all these years. To my colleagues and mentors who read earlier versions of this work, I am eternally grateful. I wish to thank my advisor at Cambridge University, Peter Carl, who taught me so much about how to solve history problems like an architect. I also wish to thank my dissertation examiner Hugh Kennedy whose generosity and thoughtful considerations of this work's scope enriched it immensely. My mentor and friend, Jere Bacharach, not only inspired through his brilliant scholarship but also believed in me resolutely and encouraged me to think boldly but write clearly.

The earliest iteration of this work was generously funded by Cambridge Overseas Trust, The British Petroleum Scholarship, and King's College, Cambridge. A special thanks to the University of California, Berkeley's Center for Middle Eastern Studies and the Sultan Postdoctoral Fellowship Program for much needed funding. A thanks to the Department of Art History at UC Berkeley for offering guidance and mentorship early in my academic career. I owe a debt of gratitude also to my supervisor at UC Berkeley, Nezar AlSayyad, who offered encouragement and mentorship during the various stages of this book. A heartfelt thanks to my colleagues at the University of Kansas and the

generous financial support of the Murphy Travel Fund. A special thanks to my Department Chairs, Linda Stone-Ferrier and David Cateforis, my faculty mentor, Anne D Hedeman and colleagues Sherry Fowler, Majid Hannoum, Katie Batza, and Pamela Sullivan who exemplified academic wisdom and kindness. Parts of this research were carried out while I was a postdoctoral fellow at the Kunsthistorisches Institut-Florenz. Being part of the KHI was an intellectual turning point and it inspired so many trajectories brought to fruition here. I wish to thank everyone at the KHI, particularly my supervisor, Gerhard Wolf, who inspired new ways of asking questions. I would also like to thank the Getty Foundation and the conveners of the *Arts of the Crusades: A Reassessment* which funded fieldwork and afforded opportunities to deepen my understanding of early Islamic architecture. A special thanks to Scott Redford, Doris Behrens-Abouseif, Robert Ousterhout, Eva Hoffman, Maria Georgopoulou and Edna Stern who offered guidance, collegiality, and friendship.

Parts of this book appear in earlier publications. Portions of Chapter 2 and 3 derive from "The Early Mosque Revisited: Introduction of the Minbar and Maqṣūra." *Muqarnas* 33 (2016): 1–16. Chapter 6 also integrates material from "The Appointed Time: Early Islamic Temporality and the Haram al-Sharif in Jerusalem." *Time and Presence in Art*. De Gruyter, (2020): 53–70. I would like to thank the editors of these publications for their insight and rigor. A special thanks to Prof. Gülrü Necipoğlu (Editor-in-Chief) and Karen Leal (Editor). I owe gratitude to my friends and collaborators, the editors of *Art and Presence*, Andrew Griebeler and Armin Bergmeier for their generosity and vision.

The University of Toronto has been my home for many years. I could not have hoped for a more nurturing institution. I was fortunate to receive multiple forms of support in terms financial, intellectual, and moral. Thank you to my former Department Chair, Carl Knappett, who took time

out of a busy schedule to read my work, met for many lunches and coffees, and helped me stay the course. A special thanks to my Department Chair, Giancarla Periti, for reading portions of this book and for her unwavering faith in my abilities. I would like to also thank Joseph Clarke, convener of the Architectural History Working Group, which has been a home to experiment and think expansively. My colleagues in Toronto were a constant source of support, wisdom, and guidance. I would like to thank Elizabeth Legge, whose warmth and encouragement set me on a steady path at UofT. A special thanks to John Paul Ricco who was a friend and companion on this writing journey. I also wish to thank my colleagues Adam Cohen, Linda Safran, Jill Caskey, Jordan Bear, Mark Cheetham, Seungjung Kim, Christy Anderson, Matt Ethan Kavaler, Elizabeth Harney, Kajri Jain, and Katherine Blouin. You all encouraged and motivated me along this path, including me in your intellectual communities and offering your support and generosity. My writing partners, Deepali Dewan and Sarah Fee, shared many triumphs and challenges along this journey. I owe you both so much and look forward to many years writing together. Being part of a stimulating community of Islamic art historians in Toronto has contributed so much to my happiness and fulfillment. I wish to thank my co-chairs of the Islamic Art and Material Collaborative at the Institute of Islamic Studies at UofT; Anver Emon, Ruba Kana'an, Fahmida Suleman, Ulrike al-Khamis, and Michael Chagnon.

On the long road to complete this book, the support of my students and research assistants was one of a kind. A warm thanks to Xin Yue Wang and Sanniah Jabeen. You enriched the experience of writing this book and offered valuable supports and insights into its reception among graduate students. A very special thanks to Jillian Husband, who was my intellectual support for the duration of this book's completion, providing invaluable feedback and research support that solidified my process and enriched my experience. My students across the globe at so many institutions motivated

me in many ways and were my mainstay and inspiration. A warm thanks to my designer Reham Shadi, who brought creativity and insight to the graphics of this book. I would also like to thank my copyeditor, Roxanne Bess Goldberg, for her thoroughness and precision. A special thanks also to the editors of this series, Marcus Milwright, Margaret Graves, and Mariam Rosser-Owen. A thanks also to Teddi Dols, editor at Brill, for her support and patience bringing this book to completion. Finally, a very warm thanks to my anonymous readers who gave of their time so generously and engaged so thoughtfully.

My family and friends have been a source of comfort and inspiration. They listened to endless renditions of this book's premise, offering unwavering love and motivation. My parents, Azza Naguib and Hosam Mostafa, taught what it means to persevere, dream big and believe in myself. They trained me to be fearless in the face of challenges, to channel my creativity and to write with generosity and grace. My lifelong companions and sisters, Hoda, Magda and Mona Mostafa, were the ones that nurtured and cheered me along this entire journey. I would not be here without them. My nieces, Jenna and Zeina, and nephews Abdelrahman, Hassan, Mahmoud, Tameem, and Hashem were always there to bring joy and happiness to my life. A special thanks also to my brothers-in-law, Ashraf Tawfik and Hisham Issa. I have been fortunate to have extended family all over the world who were lovingly engaged throughout this journey. My dear cousins Yasser Mohsen, Sherif Aboushadi, Heba and Shahira al-Soufany, Ahmed, Tarek, and Dina Naguib were my friends and companions. My Uncle Hassan and Aunt Marsha Naguib were there for so many of the highs and lows. I am grateful for all their love. I wish to also thank my friends Rose Marie, Antoinette, and Joseph Pietras, who stood by me during challenging times and whose love and kindness meant so much. The Lolley family were such a great support, a warm thanks to Brenda, James, Christine, Tom, Sarah, Peter, and the children. I am eternally grateful to my dearest friends Alia al-Kadi, Aliaa Abaza,

Inji Mekhemer, Ed Shadi, Rizwan Mawani, Carol Bier, Jeanne Pansard-Besson, Katrina Gold, Amir Gohar, Mohamed Safwat, Philippe Lavoie, and Lia Grimberg Lavoie. Some of you wrote with me, some of you thought with me, and all of you fought with me. You will never know what a difference that

made. A final special thanks to the Belinko family who cheered me on in the critical final stages. To my loved one who asked not to be named. You live in my heart and you are its fortress. Your love can be traced through many of these pages.

Figures and Plates

Figures

- 1.1 Standing Caliph Dinar, Caliph 'Abd al-Malik, issued in 694/5 CE. (Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford) 8
- 1.2 Mihrab in the cave below the rock with inset black stone disc, Dome of the Rock, Jerusalem. (Heba Mostafa) 10
- 2.1 An early minbar and maqsura (862) in carved teak wood, the Great Mosque of Kairouan. (Bernard O'Kane) 25
- 2.2 The minbar of the Vizier Badr al-Jamali (d. 1094) under the Fatimid Caliph al-Mustansir (r. 1036–1094) at the Mosque of Abraham, Hebron. (Originally located in the Shrine of al-Husayn, Ascalon). (Heba Mostafa) 26
- 2.3 Fresco depicting Caliph al-Walid II reclining on a *sarīr* at the Umayyad palace of Qusayr 'Amra, Jordan. (Heba Mostafa) 32
- 2.4 Fresco depicting enthroned ruler in the throne niche of the Umayyad palace of Qusayr 'Amra, Jordan. (Heba Mostafa) 33
- 2.5 Fresco of footstool beneath the *sarīr* of Caliph al-Walid II at the Umayyad palace of Qusayr 'Amra, Jordan. (Heba Mostafa) 33
- 2.6 Carved Stucco depicting lower portion of enthroned ruler at the Umayyad Palace of Qasr al-Hayr al-Gharbi, Damascus National Museum. (Heba Mostafa) 33
- 3.1 Mosque of the Prophet in Medina, based on Akkouche's reconstruction. 42
- 3.2 Great Mosque of Damascus under Caliph al-Walid I. (K.A.C. Creswell Archive, Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford) 45
- 3.3 Great Mosque of Damascus indicating location of courtyard connecting the mosque and the palace (Qubbat al-Khadra'). (Richard Phené Spiers) 45
- 3.4 The Mosque at Wasit, showing location of Dar al-Imara to the south and change in qibla alignment. (Fu'ad Safar) 47
- 4.1 Aerial view of the Great Mosque of Damascus showing location of Qubbat al-Khadra' to the south of the qibla wall. (Robert Harding-Alamy Stock Photo) 52
- 4.2 Church of the Holy Sepulchre, Jerusalem (reconstruction), showing Christ Pantocrator in the apex of the dome. (Heba Mostafa) 55
- 4.3 Astrological ceiling showing signs of the zodiac, Temple of Bel, Palmyra, Syria, c.32 CE. (Heba Mostafa) 56
- 4.4 Astrological ceiling showing locations of constellations, located above the caldarium at Qusayr 'Amra. (Heba Mostafa) 57
- 4.5 Paradisiacal dome, stucco, Khirbat al-Mafjar, Jericho. (Rockefeller Archaeological Museum) 57
- 4.6 Church (Basilica A), view toward the apse, al-Rusafa, Syria, c.500. Mosque built by Caliph Hisham lay to the north. (Heba Mostafa) 63
- 4.7 Domed gateway to Umayyad palace complex (which also served as audience hall), Amman, Jordan. (Heba Mostafa) 64
- 4.8 Remains of the Umayyad Dar al-Imara in Jerusalem with connecting bridge to the mosque of al-Aqsa visible to the left. (Heba Mostafa) 65

- 4.9 The Round City of Baghdad, showing location of the Qubbat al-Khadra' at the center. (K.A.C. Creswell Archive, Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford) 65
- 4.10 Al-Iwan al-Kabir (Dar al-Adl), Mamluk audience hall, Cairo, fourteenth century, exterior. (Stanley Lane-Poole) 66
- 4.11 Umayyad brazier (iron and bronze), c. eighth century. Excavated at the Umayyad palace of al-Fudayn, Jordan. (Jordan Archaeological Museum) 69
- 5.1 Silver Drachm of Ziyad b. Abi Sufyan, 673. (British Museum) 77
- 5.2 Timeline of the reign of Mu'awiya (as governor under 'Uthman and 'Ali and as caliph) and Ziyad as governor 78
- 5.3 The Great Mosque of Kufa (reconstructed) as built by Ziyad b. Abi Sufyan. (K.A.C. Creswell Archive, Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford) 85
- 5.4 Reconstruction of the Dar al-Imara and Mosque at Kufa. 85
- 5.5 The Dar al-Imara at Kufa showing Layer 1, Layer 2, and Layer 3. (K.A.C. Creswell Archive, Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford) 87
- 5.6 Plan of Sarvistan indicating locations of sampled timber. 1. Main domed hall, 2. Internal courtyard, 3. Main Iwan, 9. Western columned hall, 10. Northeastern domed hall, 12. Eastern columned hall, 11. Western entrance Iwan. (Morteza Djamali, et. al.) 88
- 5.7 The Dar al-Imara at Kufa, columned hall preceding domed audience chamber. (Crystal Kessler) 88
- 5.8 Dar al-Khatib (Dar al-Imam) at the Umayyad Mosque at the Citadel of Amman, ground floor plan (Umayyad layer in red). Note the location of the qibla wall as indicated by the niche mihrab and the axiality of the entrance of the Dar to the mosque entryway. (Ignacio Arce) 89
- 6.1 Umayyad Jerusalem, showing location of the Haram al-Sharif 96
- 6.2 The Dome of the Ascension (left), the Haram al-Sharif, Jerusalem. The current dome post-dates the Umayyad period, with the original constructed under Caliph 'Abd al-Malik b. Marwan, c.692. (Heba Mostafa) 97
- 6.3 Timeline of Second Islamic Civil War 98
- 6.4 The Dome of the Rock and the Dome of the Chain, 'Abd al-Malik b. Marwan, 692. Jerusalem. (Heba Mostafa) 99
- 6.5 Layout of the Haram al-Sharif, Jerusalem. 104
- 6.6 The Dome of the Rock, ground floor plan. (K.A.C. Creswell Archive, Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford) 108
- 6.7 Khirbat al-Mafjar, figures in the pendentives of the dome leading into the bathhouse, under Caliph Hisham b. 'Abd al-Malik and al-Walid II, c.743. (Rockefeller Archaeological Museum) 109
- 6.8 Khirbat al-Mafjar, under Caliph Hisham b. 'Abd al-Malik and al-Walid II, Standing Caliph on lion pedestal, c.743. (Rockefeller Archaeological Museum) 110
- 6.9 Betyl within niche, al-Siq, Petra, Jordan (Heba Mostafa) 112
- 6.10 The Dome of the Rock, mosaics showing winged motif. (Bernard O'Kane) 115
- 6.11 Stucco fragment showing partial winged motif, Qasr al-Hayr al-Gharbi, Caliph Hisham b. 'Abd al-Malik, Damascus National Museum (Heba Mostafa) 116
- 6.12 The Dome of the Chain, the Haram al-Sharif, Jerusalem, under 'Abd al-Malik b. Marwan, c.692. (Heba Mostafa) 118

- 7.1 Mosaics at the Great Mosque of Damascus, al-Walid I, 705–15. (Heba Mostafa) 122
- 7.2 Qusayr ‘Amra, main hall, with the enthronement scenes, within throne alcove upon a *kursī* (center) and upon the bedstead or *sarīr* (right). (Heba Mostafa) 124
- 7.3 The Great Mosque of Cordoba, maqsura and mihrab, extension of al-Hakam II, 965. (Heba Mostafa) 130
- 7.4 General view of the Maqsura of al-Hakam II, Great Mosque of Cordoba. (Heba Mostafa) 131

Plates

- 1 Map of the Umayyad Empire indicating locations of Umayyad mosques xvi
- 2 Timeline of the Formation of Islamic Architecture and the Formation of the Islamic State xvii

Note on Transliteration

Transliteration of names and Arabic terms that entered common parlance follow the IJMES system but without the addition of dotted consonants

and the marking of long vowels. Arabic transliterations in the text and notes that follow the IJMES system are italicized.

Plates



PLATE 1 Map of the Umayyad Empire indicating locations of Umayyad mosques
DRAWN BY REHAM SHADI

